SCRIPTA MEDITERRANEA

Volume XXVI 2005

CANADIAN INSTITUTE
FOR MEDITERRANEAN STUDIES

INSTITUT CANADIEN
D'ÉTUDES MÉDITERRANÉENNES

SCRIPTA MEDITERRANEA

Scripta Mediterranea is the journal of the Canadian Institute for Mediterranean Studies, an international learned society based in Canada and devoted to the study of all aspects of Mediterranean culture and civilization, past and present, with a special interest in interdisciplinary and cross-cultural investigation.

General Correspondence

The Editors,
Scripta Mediterranea,
Canadian Institute for Mediterranean Studies, 2006.
c/o Department of Spanish and Portuguese,
University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada, M5S 1K7.

Cover by: Vinicio Scarci

Produced by: Legas, 3 Wood Aster Bay, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada, K2R 1B3. www.legaspublishing.com

ISSN 0226 8418

Scripta Mediterranea

Volumes XXVI, 2005

Contents

Gerhard Steingress

MEDITERRANEANITY AS CULTURAL HERITAGE. POLITICS WITH THE PAST.

> To some extent each of us feels a part of a historical, philosophical and economic process which began in the dawn of civilization and has come down to us via an infinite sequence of links. Those who live in the lands bounded by the Mediterranean feel in the depths of their being a strong sense of belonging to that unending chain of events and ideas and partakes in that culture, whatever region they may come from. Each of us in our small way, whether we come from Palestine or Catalonia, from the myriad islands of Dalmatia or the coasts of Northern Africa, feels that we are a short stretch of road on that endless journey marked on the map of culture and progress. Feels a child of the earth—the mother of all civilizations—and perceives a sense of history, which carries us forward, and at the same time urges us to carry forward a given trade or idea or scheme bequeathed to us by our fathers.
>
> (Betelli, 2003: 5)

The first "proclamation of a masterpiece of the oral and intangible cultural heritage of mankind" took place on May 18th 2001 at the seat of UNESCO in Paris. That is almost thirty years after the Convention of the Cultural and Natural Patrimony of Mankind (1972), but only four years after the 29th Session of the General Conference in November 1997, where this concept was formulated and accepted. As the present general director of the UNESCO, Koïchiro Matsuura, states, the special emphasis given to the oral and intangible cultural patrimony of humanity was the consequence of the recognition of the "threat, traditional cultures are exposed to" and, therefore, the necessity to preserve cultural diversity in the world.[1]

The particular aim of the efforts to be made on this account consists, he concludes, in the correction of the present asymmetrical situation which favours the countries of the "North" and the protection of their material patrimony[2] at the expense of the countries of the "South"

[1] *Première proclamation*, p. 2.

[2] Between 1972 and 2002, 690 objects were included in the UNESCO list of material patrimony.

which suffer the exclusion of their non-material cultural heritage although it is basic for their cultural diversity. The proposal made by Matsuura is not at all surprising, and should be taken as a challenge, especially with respect to future initiatives made by the "South,"including that of Europe itself.

There is probably no other region on the planet where the history of *homo sapiens* has developed in such a concentrated and intensive way as in that of the Mediterranean, including all aspects of human life. For this reason it seems admissible and useful to speak of "mediterraneanity" as a concept which expresses the integral character of many of the central aspects of a common lifestyle and way of thinking which emerged as a consequence of a commonly shared, although very ambiguous history since the early dawn of civilization. This proposal is merely provisional, heuristic, as there is a certain danger of exaggeration or even ideological arrogance due to the vagueness of the concept. In no way is it introduced as an ethnocentric approach, as an attempt to subordinate the affected cultural artefacts to the clutch of postindustrial and postmodern societies with their demand for "exotic" material in order to mend their lacerated cultural identities. "Mediterraneanity" does not refer to the part which Europe plays in the cultural concert but rather to its own cultural composition. Indeed, as Greek mythology tells us, Europe appeared as the product of a rapacious Zeus who, fascinated by the charm of the daughter of Agenor, a king of the shores of Minor Asia, turned himself into a gentle bull, and abducted her across the Sea to Crete. Following this metaphor, Europe was born as the consequence of both an act of amorousness and a crime, of attraction and subordination, by which Orient and Occident came together, became fused, hybrids, something new, independent and self-reliant. And, there is no doubt, that the same mythological bull continued his ambiguous tour towards the sunset to settle on the banks of ancient Gades (the Spanish Cádiz). As we can see, the myth has its own, deeper, although hidden meaning as it refers to the mythical origin of what today has become a growing preoccupation with the destructiveness of progress and globalization: the organic relation between Mediterranean nature (space) and culture.[3] I will briefly explore this concept in order to respond to

[3]With respect to this aspect, I would like to mention only three initiatives: that of the Centro de Cooperación del Mediterráneo UICN (Center of Cooperation in the Mediterranean) and its multinational program, developed in cooperation with the International Union for the Conservation of Nature and Natural Ressources, which aims at the declaration of zones of protection in the Mediterranean area; the Socrates-Program "Influence of the situation as an island and the Mediterranean Sea in culture and environment," realized by Italy, France and the Balearic Islands; and the project of the Southern-France

the question of the validity or non-validity of a genuine "Mediterranean cultural patrimony" or "heritage."

The European "South," whenever we have a more precise look at the map, comprises a region where Occident and Orient have met for thousands of years, which is influenced and characterized by the Maghreb in such a way that it has attracted people and cultures from all over Europe since antiquity and up until contemporary tourism, still conserving much of the exotic flair that romantic travellers of the 19th century were so fascinated by. The reason seems to be quite simple. It is the existence of a geographic concept that induces or provokes multiple social and cultural contacts, either peaceful or warlike ones: the Mediterranean Sea. As a line of communication it soon became the centre of attraction for the three continents its waters touch, a network of economic and cultural exchange, as well as the basis of a common shared history and destiny for its people. For that reason the geographic concept reveals constantly its cultural dimension, not only in the material sense of it, but also with respect to the "spirit" that probably confirms one of the most essential differences between the European and the (North-) American mentality and philosophy. It is this peculiar "medium," created in space and time by the endless throng of people and cultures that set foot in this region, which we understand as "Mediterraneanity." It is due to these circumstances that almost everything that happens in this place and its hinterland becomes an object of cultural exchange and therefore the reason for the overwhelming cultural diversity. As a space of encounter and of contrasts, the Mediter-raneanity acts as the medium, where the cultural heritage is indefatigably reproduced, passed from one generation to the other, at the same time becoming adapted to their more or less collective necessities, desires and interests. In view of its function as a historically developed catalyst of social and cultural transformation, the concept cannot hide its connection with processes like acculturation, transculturation and hybridization; it rather reveals how far from reality was the 19th century idea(l) of national culture, and to what extent that idea still is a dangerous obstacle for the peaceful cohabitation of people. In the concept of "Mediterraneanity" we can find a synthesis of the Jewish-Christian and Moslem cultures that led into a kind of shared civilization, with both profane and religious emphasis. Well, there is no doubt that the religious factor repeatedly served, and still serves, as an ideological instrument of division and hate, but there is also no doubt that cultural diver-

---

Maison Méditerranéenne des Sciences de l'Homme on "Réseau thématique des centres européens de recherche en sciences humaines sur l'ensemble euro-méditerranéen" (REMSH), with the participation of 12 institutions from seven European countries.

sity is almost a spontaneous consequence of social life that is destroyed mainly by economic egoism and political uniformity and stupidity. For that reason, we have no illusion that our concept still is much like an ideal to be realized, as it refers to a cultural dynamic based on the existence of class societies. Our focus is mainly a cultural one, and as we are not willing to identify culture simply with the superstructure of class society, we are dealing with its own dynamic or capacity to express the knowledge and experience of peoples' everyday-life as it becomes reflected in their languages and in a widespread web of kinship and social relations, with their particular and very different traditions. We refer to a mental, spiritual and intellectual medium, which includes—at least—the possibility for mutual comprehension and tolerance, merged into the cultural heritage of a significant segment of humanity, with a very singular complexity and diversity.

However, the Mediterranean, seen as a "synonyme d'équilibre humain, de naturel et d'aise", as writes Marc Loopuyt (Loopuyt, w.y.: 81), is quite an abstract, ficticious concept. Its real condition is characterised by two grand axes which combine diversity with difference, as Gille Léothaud and Bernard Lortat-Jacob emphasize: "l'un septentrional, l'autre méridional, induisant des différences bien marquées" (Léothaud/Lortat-Jacob, w.y.: 9). Indeed, it is not only the socio-economic inequality which explains the material diferences and cultural diversity from Turkey to Spain and from Lybia to Norway; there is also the fact, that "les langues et les peuples méditerranéens ne présentent pas une grande unité" (ibid.). The cultural dimension of Mediterraneanity is, for that reason, also full of contrasts and conflictivity, which make it difficult to speak of a "Mediterranean identity" in terms of validity and without further restrictions. There is no wonder that Léothaud and Lortat-Jacob stress especially the case of music as a intangible cultural medium where comparisons are fruitful and demonstrate to what extent the acculturation processes may serve as the basis for a common cultural Mediterranean tradition in spite of the threatening, technically induced trends toward cultural standardisation.

It is the explicit intention of UNESCO to bring out those cultural spaces and forms of expression included in this intangible heritage of mankind. For that reason it established a series of legal and administrative prerequisites expressed in the key-notions of the "oral and intangible patrimony" (*patrimoine oral et immatériel*) and the "cultural masterpiece" (*chef-d'œuvre*). In this context arise some questions. The first refers to the sense it makes to speak of a particular Mediterranean cultural heritage or patrimony considering the fact that it deals with highly demarcated practices and meanings narrowly related to very particular, mostly local communities. Does it make sense, in order to give some examples, to comprehend the Turkish dance of the Dervishes, the

Greek Rebetika or the Andalusian Flamenco as phenomena of Mediterraneanity without corrupting the criteria introduced and maintained by UNESCO, i.e. to select only those cultural masterpieces based on tradition and popular expression that demonstrate an extraordinary value with respect to human creativity? Consequently, a second question points at the criteria of "exclusivity" the UNESCO claims for the admission of such cultural masterpieces, as it seems to be quite hair-splitting to define them in this sense in view of the fact that the Mediterranean is a region mainly characterized by exchange, fusion and hybridization. That is to say, the real basis for the exclusivity of most of the cultural sites and forms consists of the cultural network in which they are embedded. A third question focuses on the reliability and validity of concepts like "patrimony" and "cultural heritage" in view of the social and cultural change this region has been exposed to for a very long time. Is it not rather a social construction of "patrimony" in order to satisfy certain needs for collective identity that prevails in the UNESCO program? To what extent does the declaration of a masterpiece really refer to a traditional and popular cultural practice and not to the intention of "inventing" tradition?

Referring to the first question, we could distinguish two levels of patrimony in accordance with the ideas of Robertson and others with respect to "glocalization."[4] there is no "pure" Mediterraneanity, but there are many local manifestations of it and for that reason it seems to be admissible to analyze them from the point of view of their communicative power and "spiritual" relationship with the surrounding space as its historical and cultural background and basis. If we refer to Mediterraneanity, we do not deny this concrete, local aspect: on the contrary, we consider these multiple cultural manifestations as the generator of the common symbolic background Mediterraneanity means to us. It is not a mysterious force that pushes local communities in this direction, but the endless chain of historical experience and social relations they share together with others in this region. For that reason, UNESCO does well if it insists on the importance of the contribution to mankind as a criterion of selection. Not all cultural elements really work in this way: some of them are quite the opposite—at least under certain circumstances—of what cultural communication, peace and dignity signi-

[4]Robertson refers to the fact that the "so-called local is being fashioned to a large extent on a trans- or super-local level," it is the product of en intervention from "outside" or "above." But, at the same time, it is a necessary basic element of globalization that the local is reflected at the same time as adapted to other necessities. Consequently, he proposes the concept of "global localization" referring to the "adaption of a global perspective to local circumstances" (Robertson, 1998: 193, 197).

fy as universal values. A good example of this is the case of the Balkans during the 1990s, when religion and ethnicity as central elements for cultural diversity apparently became the reason for violence and all kinds of crimes. There is no doubt, that this horrific landscape was a well-calculated attempt to mask the real economic and political aims and interests at work in the struggle for partition and redistribution of the former Federal Yugoslavian Republic and the implantation of a new hegemony.

A first answer to the second question might emphasize that the politics of patrimony of UNESCO is rather pragmatic and based on a phenomenology of cultural affairs easily definable, while a more theoretical concept of Mediterraneanity requires the analysis of socio-cultural dynamics which produced singular masterpieces that international attention is focused on.

The third question is quite polemical as it refers to the relationship between patrimony and political power. First of all it should be taken into account that the trend towards patrimonialization is principally unlimited: any cultural manifestation can be considered or not as "exclusive" and as a "masterpiece." It only depends on how rigorously the criteria are applied, although there might exist certain impediments in international law and generally shared ethical and moral standards by which "exclusive" socio-cultural practices like, for example, female circumcision, are definitely excluded. Others like cock-fights or bull-fights, although they are deeply rooted in cultural history, social life and the identity of certain communities, and even as objects of human creativity, may be unacceptable in other cultures. Well, the term "patrimonialization" reveals the patrimony as a social construction, and as such, as the result of political influence and power. Following some of the basic sociological concepts of Max Weber, patrimonialization refers to the process of substitution of the former power of disposition carried out directly (personally) by the head of the "family," i. e. community (*pater familias*), in favour of political power established as an abstract entity that includes—especially—protagonists from outside the community. Patrimony is not only the recognition and the protection of a defined cultural site or cultural forms of expression, but a well-intended intervention into the dynamics of a culture and the communities, that they belong to (Steingress, 2002).

It is not at all surprising, when we observe that this kind of rational interference into social and cultural life was born exactly with the Enlightment, when the individual became recognized as the basic unit of social and political organization of society. It was then that, when culture became of particular value in human life, as it was considered the manifestation of the human genius, of man's creativity and the centrality of the community. As Ariño points out, patrimonialization refers to

"una pratica storica figlia della modernidad,"[5] to the reflection of Modernity induced by itself, i.e. reflexive Modernity (Beck), and for that reason the function of protection that substantiates the politics of patrimonialization is quite questionable. Not particularly because it is, as the practices of UNESCO itself demonstrates, a reaction to the de-traditionalization of the everyday-life and cultural standardization as the consequences of the increasing network of globalization, but rather because it seems to be based on an idea of cultural dynamics that opposes tradition to modernity, that comprehends cultural diversity preferably in terms of tradition and less in those tendencies oriented in the intellectual and spiritual concepts mankind develops with a view to the future. In contrast, our concept of Mediterraneanity is defined as a kind of superstructure developing as the consequence of social and cultural change, as a synthesis expressed in the broad diversity of lifestyles and ways of thought we are dealing with in this context. As a consequence, Europeans perceive their common history and define themselves rather in terms of difference than uniformity, although they necessarily construct their way of life in accordance with the cultural medium that they share with the "others," because they live in the same space, under the auspices of a common past and exposed to the same problems. So, the conservation of cultural heritage has to be understood as an intentional act realized under the socio-economic conditions of contrary interests and tendencies. This aspect becomes clearly reflected, for example, in the above mentioned project of the Maison Méditerranéenne des Sciences de l'Homme, where we read:

> "Cette proposition s'inscrit dans le cadre d'une réflexion globale sur l'ensemble euro-méditerranéen...Une telle réflexion part du constant que la Méditerranée est une zone de tension fortement influencée par le processus d'intégration européenne, notamment à l'heure de l'élargissement vers l'Est. Elle est une scène où s'articulent processus de mondialisation, spécificités régionales et poids de l'histoire. Enfin, la question des relations de l'Europe avec l'ensemble méditerranéen n'est pas seulement une question extérieure, elle relève tout autant de réalités intérieures avec l'installation durable en Europe de populations venant du Sud et de l'Est méditerranéen qui confèrent aux sociétés européennes un caractère multiculturel accentué."[6]

As we can see, Europe continues under construction and by no means was it finished with the stratagem of Zeus. Its current situation,

---

[5]Ariño, 2000: 10.

[6]*Les programmes européennes*, p. 1-2.

characterized—on the one hand—by a long historical, socio-economical, political and cultural entanglement with the space bordering with the Mediterranean Sea, and—on the other hand—by its almost permanent and conflictive hegemony, and now by globalization, transforms the whole region into a dynamic milieu where traditions not only are kept alive but are also embossed with new patterns. Hence, the cultural heritage worthy to be preserved can only be protected whenever it stands the test as a meaningful reference for future human behaviour.

The ideological dimension of patrimony

The present conservationist trend and postmodern traditionalism are facts that have to be taken into account when analyzing the politics of patrimonialization. They are narrowly related with some of the consequences of modernization itself. Within the idiosyncrasy of postmodern thought and aesthetics, these tendencies are the subject not only of the commercialization of transculturally dislocated traditions but also of the construction of fragmented identities within the framework of a tessellated culture. The conservation of their cultural heritage has become a general necessity for those who feel themselves exposed to a counterproductive individualism and the uncertainty of a supposed pluralistic society. The regression to tradition is, consequently, intended to stabilize social relations and cultural significance by means of historical consciousness, and patrimony turns out to be the most reliable point of reference. There is nothing completely new in this behavior, it rather can be revealed as the unwanted child of Modernity itself, as its anti-enlightening, restorative variant, which tries to convince us that everything that demonstrates a certain capacity of persistency in time and space is, therefore, good and reasonable. Today, in view of the destructive consequences of capitalist globalization, as it is reflected particularly in the socially produced lack of substance of identity, the regression to tradition means the recovery of the pre-modern cultural heritage, its patrimonialization. This identification of identity with the past means the exclusion of the traditions of Modernity, based on critical reason and the values derived from it such as liberty, individualism, rationalism, criticism, self-reliance, responsibility, autonomy, etc. This makes clear to what degree the definition of cultural heritage is embedded in and, consequently, influenced by the ideology of the dominant type of society. As Ariño emphasizes with respect to the history of the concept of patrimony, its concrete meaning is submitted to the determination of the human spirit as it is determined by the place and time. But there is no doubt that "the linkage between culture and identity has become more problematic," or even more: "that there have never been national cultures" (Featherstone/Lash, 1999: 1). There is only one logical con-

clusion: *cultural heritage is a social construction of something that never existed as such, although it is based on real human experience, transformed into a myth in order to sustain collective and individual identity; it is not the reflection of the past in the present, but it reflects the relationship of mankind to its past and the significance of its creativity as well as the priorities it establishes in accordance with the relations of inequality and power.*

From "monument" to "cultural value"

Originally, during the 18th century, cultural heritage was exclusively identified with material objects or goods (the fine arts), with the monuments that demonstrated the glory of the ruling classes and their elites, their social status. It was towards the end of the 19th century, when the concept became substantially enlarged. This conceptual revision was the consequence of at least two facts: first, the growing interest and dedication of romanticists with respect to the significance of popular culture; second, the observations, made by an emerging anthropology, of the importance of ethnicity for cultural diversity and the universal value of all cultures independent of their "degree" of historical evolution. Thence, culture was not anymore defined exclusively in terms of the privileged social elites and classes, but rather as the manifestation of the lifestyle of the people themselves. For this reason it is understandable that studies of cultural phenomena began to focus especially on the cultural heritage or cultural value of other people and ethnic communities. In the sense of "popular culture", the new reference framework of social perception of cultural values brought about the attitude change to represent the whole cultural heritage (with all its difference and diversity) as a subject of importance for museums and encyclopedic description. In accordance with this change in the social perception of cultural reality, the former cultural "monument" of early Modernity now became an object of relative value in view of the growing amount of significant cultural values that reflected all that was considered as a meaningful expression or testimony of the life of any human community. Since then, any effort made in order to preserve the cultural heritage of mankind as the manifestation of its diversity includes both the concept of the "monument" and of culture as empowerment. This fact became evident for the first time after the end of the Second World War in the Convention of The Hague of May 14th 1954, which aimed to protect cultural property in case of armed conflicts and which became rapidly ratified and applied by a series of European States under the impact of the Cold War.[7] Effectively, this protection

[7]Remember the thin, flat tablets of metal which were fixed to most of the significant buildings and monuments, with the description in German, English,

bore in mind exclusively selected objects of material culture,[8] especially buildings of outstanding cultural value as well as historical monuments. In the following decades it became widely recognized that these material objects include a non-material, symbolic dimension, in whose concrete manifestation they remain. From that moment on the non-material aspect of human culture became a central subject in the definition of what "cultural value" really means. As far as it reflected the fact that the diversity of culture is based essentially on the intellectual and spiritual interaction of men with nature and society, "material culture" became comprehended as its material manifestation. The idea of creation, taken as the significant, essential point of reference for the designation of the intangible dimension of cultural heritage, burst forth, as Ariño comments:"the act of creation itself is not physical. Interpretation and the creative act are untouchable: they are implicit in the skill or the technique of those who realize them."[9] This reorientation became manifest in a series of political initiatives: in 1950 Japan decided to develop a program dedicated to the registration of all its "living national tresures,"especially those based on the artistry of certain persons which was reflected in specific material cultural values. Also well-known are the numerous projects on sonic landscapes in order to identify and record the broad spectrum of naturally and culturally produced sounds. But it was only in 1989, when the UNESCO took the decisive step of adopting the"Recommendation on the Safeguarding of Traditional Culture and Folklore,"[10] and in 1997 when Marrakesh saw the international meeting of experts on the preservation of sites of popular culture, (also an initiative of UNESCO), based on the proposal made by the Spanish writer Luis Goytisolo.[11] It was there that the concept of "oral patrimony of humanity" was definitively born as an instrument to be used by the different member-states against the

---

French and Russian: "Kulturdenkmal. Cultural Property. Bien culturel (...). Protected by the Convention of The Hague, dated 14 may 1954, for the protection of cultural property in the event of armed conflicts."

[8]When US-American physician Edward Tellar—at the beginning of the 1980s, during the Reagan administration—defended the superiority of the neutron-bomb with the argument that this "clean" weapon only destroys organic life, but not inorganic objects, the Convention of The Hague had lost its former, quite utopian character.

[9]"el acto mismo de la creación no tiene forma física. La interpretación y el acto creador son intangibles: están encarnados en la destreza o la técnica de quienes lo realizan" (Ariño, 2002: 135).

[10]General Conference, 25th session, Paris, 15 November 1989.

[11]UNESCO, Ececutive Board, 154th session, Paris, March 19th 1998: http://unesdoc.unesco.org/ima ges/0011/001111/111165s.pdf

increasing commercialization and folklorization of traditional popular culture.

The UNESCO "Proclamation of Masterpieces of the Oral and Intangible heritage of Humanity"[12]

The priority of UNESCO concerning the protection and revitalization of the intangible cultural patrimony of mankind rests on a double strategy: a first, short-term one refers to the proclamation of corresponding masterpieces; a second, long-term one aims at the establishment of the necessary general legal prerequisites (as in the previous case of the material patrimony) in order to motivate and support national governments and local communities to follow the established guidelines of safeguarding. As a first, practical step the Proclamation provides for the development of a list which includes such intangible cultural values. Due to this, on May 18th 2001 a total of 19 cultural sites or cultural manifestations proposed by a 18 member-jury became incorporated in the first list of cultural patrimony to be protected. This proceeding was guided by the idea of giving preference to those values characterized by two conditions: they must be a manifestation of cultural "vitality" at the same time as being in a situation where immediate preventive measures had to be taken. Priority was given to cultural manifestations and sites like languages, music, epopee, rituals and traditional knowledge.[13] Its reasons are quite comprehensible in view of the present world-wide social and cultural dynamics: "Nous avons constaté que les menaces sont égalment innombrables, qu'ils s'agisse des aspects négatifs de la moncialisation, du déplacement des peuples à la suite d'une inestabilité politique et socio-économique, de la détérioration de l'environnement, du dévelopment incontrôlé du tourisme, ou de la folklorisation."[14] With respect to the member-states which propose a motion, three steps are to be made in accordance with the Proclamation: first, the preparation of an inventory of those sites or manifestations to be protected because of their exceptional cultural value; second, the presentation of an accurate plan for safeguarding them; third, their incor-

---

[12] In the following, we make reference to two main documents of the UNESCO in French: the first one is the "Première Proclamation des chefs-d'œuvres du patrimoine oral et immatériel de l'humanité", cited as "*Première Proclamation*"; the second one, with the same main-title, was published in 2001 with the subtitle "Guide pour la présentation des dossiers de candidature" and will be cited as "*Guide pour la présentation*".

[13] *Première Proclamation*, p. 3.

[14] Ibid.

poration in UNESCO list is considered a necessary measure by part of the proposing State to initiate tangible measures for safeguarding them.[15] In the course of the realization of these aims the different member-states of UNESCO were invited by its General Director by letter from October 15 of 2001 to establish the necessary national institutions with respect to the protection of its intangible and oral patrimony.[16]

Strategic significance, objectives and objects of the "Proclamation"

Now, the notion "patrimony" has replaced—on an international level—terms such as "cultural value" or "heritage" and will be used therefore in a synonymous way.

The **significance** of the proceedings offered by the UNESCO with respect to their safeguarding is sustained basically on the recognition of its"exceptional value" in view of the intention to maintain cultural diversity on a global level. The concept "oral and intangible heritage," as it was defined by the Executive Board in November 1998[17] in accordance with the recommendations made nine years before,[18] comprises

> l'ensemble des créations émanant d'une communauté culturelle fondées sur la tradition, exprimées par un groupe ou par des individus et reconnues comme répondant aux attents de la communauté en tant qu'expressions de l'identité culturelle et sociale de celle-ci, les normes et les valeurs se transmettant oralement, par imitation ou d'autres façons. Ses formes comprennent, entre autres, la langue, la littérature, la musique, la danse, les jeux, la mythologie, les rites, les coutumes et le savoire-faire de l'artisanat, l'architecture et d'autres arts.[19]

A similar definition was made in 2001 by a group of experts during a meeting in Turin and adopted a few months later by the Executive Board and the General Conference. Accordingly, the patrimony we are referring to includes

> les processus acquis par les peuples ainsi que les savoirs, les compétences et la créativité dont ils sont les héritiers et qu'ils développent,

---

[15] Ibid.

[16] "Annexe II. Création d'organismes nationaux pour la protection du patrimoine culturel inmatériel", in: *Guide pour la présentation*, pp. 32-33.

[17] "Annexe I. Règlement relativ à la proclamation par l'UNESCO des chefs-d'oeuvre du patrimoin oral et inmatÈriel de l'humanitÈ", in: *Guide pour la prÈsentation*, pp. 26-30

[18] "Annexe III. Recommandation sur la sauvegarde de la culture traditionelle et populaire adoptée par la Conférence Géneral à sa vingt-cinquième session, Paris, 15 novembre 1989", in: *Guide pour la présentation*, pp. 34-39.

[19] "Annexe I. Règlement relativ...", in: *Guide pour la présentation*, p. 26.

> les produits qu'ils créent et les ressources, espaces et autres dimensions du cadre social et naturel nécessaires à leur durabilité; ces processus inspirent aux communautés vivantes un sentiment de continuité par rapport aux générations qui les ont précédées et revêtent une importance cruciale pour l'identité culturelle ainsi que la sauvegarde de la diversité culturelle et de la créativité de l'humanité.[20]

Well, although both definitions are perfectly congruent, the second one puts special emphasis on the process of the production of the cultural heritage, its consequences and its particular significance for the construction of collective identities, whilst the first one focuses mainly on the cultural manifestation itself. Another difference consists in the fact that the experts which met in Turin laid a special—more sociological—emphasis on the *social and natural framework*, in which these processes are embedded.

Another important aspect of the significance of the concept refers to the *reasons* for safeguarding. The intangible and oral patrimony is considered a "vital factor" for the following three reasons: first, it sustains cultural identity; second, it promotes creativity; third, it helps to preserve cultural diversity. But, it is a "vital factor" exposed to danger because of a series of counteracting factors such as cultural uniformity, armed conflicts, tourism, industrialization, migration from the rural areas to urban sites and from/to other countries, as well as the degradation of the environment.[21] And the Declaration of Masterpieces finally emphasizes the protection of the oral and intangible patrimony as an important contribution to tolerance and harmonic relations between the different cultures.[22]

As to which **objects** of the initiative UNESCO refers to, a clear distinction between "popular and traditional forms of expression" and "cultural sites" is established.[23] The first category includes cultural manifestations like languages, orally transmitted literature, music, dance, games, myths, rituals, costumes, artistry and architecture; the second one aims at those places where popular cultural activities are traditionally sited and periodically executed, for example processions, market-places, festivals or public rituals. The selection of the objects follows the criteria and practices established by UNESCO in its extensive guidelines.[24]

---

[20] *Guide pour la présentation*, p. 5.

[21] *Première Proclamation*, p. 5.

[22] *Guide pour la présentation*, p. 3.

[23] *Première Proclamation*, p. 5.

[24] "IV. Soumissions des dossiers de candidature", in: *Guide pour la présentation*, pp. 6-23.

The **objectives** of the Proclamation are the logical consequence of its strategy and are summarized in the "First Declaration" of UNESCO on the oral and intangible patrimony and consist in:

— alerting public opinion, in reference to the value and the necessity of the safeguarding and revitalization of this kind of patrimony;
— its localization and evaluation on a global level;
— mobilization of all countries in order to create stock-lists of their oral and intangible cultural heritage as well as to develop legal and administrative proceedings in this direction;
— promotion and support of traditional artistry, artists and local initiatives in order to identify and restore the intangible patrimony. At the same time this request also is directed to governments and non-governmental organizations as well as local communities; it invites persons, groups, institutions and organizations to participate in its administration, preservation, protection and promotion.[25]

Classified objects of the intangible cultural heritage

Until the end of 2002 a total of 19 manifestations of cultural expression or cultural sites have been incorporated into the UNESCO list, namely: 1) Language, dance and music of the Garifuna (Belize); 2) the oral genre Gelede (music, songs, dances and masks of the Yoruba-nago and the Fon et Mahi in Benin); 3) the carnival of Oruro (Bolivia); 4) the opera Kunqu (China); 5) the trumpets of Gbofe from Afounkaha (the musical and cultural site of the Tagbana in Ivory Coast); 6) the cultural site (music, dance, national festival) of the brotherhood Saint-Esprit des Congos from Villa Mella (Dominican Republic); 7) the oral heritage and the cultural expressions of the Zapara people (Ecuador and Peru); 8) the Georgian polyphonic chant (Georgia); 9) the cultural site of the Sosso-Bala instrument of the Mandingue community (Guinea); 10) the Sanskrit theater Kutiyattam from Kerala (India); 11) the Sicilian puppet-theater Opera dei Pubi (Italy); 12) the Nôgaku theater (Japan); 13) the creation and the symbolism of the crucifix (Lithuania, with the support of Latvia); 14) the cultural site of the Jemaa el-Fnaa square in Marrakesh (Morocco); 15) the *hudhud* recital of the Ifugao community (Philippines); 16) the ancestral royal ritual and the ritual music of the sanctuary of Jongmyo (Corean Republic); 17) the cultural site and the oral culture of the Semeiskie communitiy (Russian Federation); 18) the Mystery of

[25] *Première Proclamation*, p. 5. See also the decision adopted by the Executive Board during its 155th session in order to find public or private patronage designated to the support of an award or measures of safeguarding, protection and revitalization of cultural sites and forms of cultural expression.

Elche (Spain) and19) the cultural space of the Boysun district (Uzbekistan).

Final conclusions

As we can see, the UNESCO initiative was aimed exclusively at safeguarding delimitated cultural spaces and practices. It could be qualified as the attempt at global reconstruction of the local and cultural identities based on traditional popular culture. Hence, the concept of "Mediterraneanity" does not fit this conception as it refers rather to the geographical and historical entity that is reflected in the cultural sites and manifestations of popular culture developed and maintained in this region. It is an entity that synthesizes traditions, at the same time that it stimulates cultural change as it is involved in the socio-economical and political development of the region. Although as an entity it cannot be defined in terms of particularity, it becomes evident as a particular quality that is represented in a great number of those cultural sites and manifestations, which are active elements in the construction of the Mediterranean and European societies. In view of the danger, inherent in the UNESCO project, of establishing a cultural piecemeal-technology to safeguard some sites and manifestations and to exclude others, we have to take into account that the best way to maintain these consists in developing the social and cultural network in which the sites and manifestations of traditional culture are embedded and from which they are challenged to develop an adequate answer to the problems of the human future in this region. That is, what "living tradition" really is: more than being a mere representation of the past, it is very important that it takes part in cultural communication, to apply its inherent knowledge and its values in the solution of present problems. In accordance with this objection, the narrow relation established between cultural heritage and cultural identity becomes a quite brittle argument in patrimonialization politics: as Douglas Kellner points out, "rather than identity disappearing in a postmodern society, it is subject to new determinations and new forces while offering new possibilities, styles, models and forms."[26] Regarding this, the concept of "Mediterraneanity" is more relevant and complex as it is a political one that refers not only to the safeguarding of a determinated class of cultural artefacts, but also to the way in which policy-making should be evaluated and oriented in accordance with developing the Mediterranean region as a space of peace, tolerance, cultural diversity, based on social and economic progress. I think that there is no other way to safeguard human culture

[26]Kellner, 1992: 174.

as a medium of self-sufficiency and happiness, to the extent that human beings generally are willing to accept the efforts they necessarily have to make in their struggle for a better life. I also think, that this often despised "old" Europe is the heir of a precious and powerful treasure that consists of its sublime, universal contribution to human culture that emerged in the ideas and values of the Enlightenment. This treasure still preserves the struggle for freedom, equality and solidarity, for human and civil rights, social and economic justice and democracy as the means by which power can become controlled by the people. In view of the upcoming"clash of civilizations" provoked by blindfolded neoliberalism we should remember that the real basis for the disappearance of precious cultural values is to be found in the mechanism of capitalism itself and its social consequences. French writer Michel Houellebecq's last novel, *Platform,* is an impressive and even sensual testimony of how local cultures are submitted to the destructive power of the capitalist market. And as fiction and reality merge in many ways, his novel became a visionary anticipation of what actually happened shortly after. Cultural politics cannot be a substitute for the social confrontation caused by economic exploitation and political oppression, but it can educate the people and their governments to prevail over them by finding some human solution.

University of Seville

Works Cited

Ariño, Antonio. "L'invenzione del patrimonio culturale e la società del rischio", in *Bollettino dell'Atlante Linguistico Italiano.* III 24 (2002): 9-35.

——."La expansión del patrimonio cultural", *Revista de Occidente* (2002): 129-150.

——. "La patrimonialización de la cultura en la sociedad del riesgo y de la información". José María García Blanco y Pablo Navarro (Ed.). *Más allá de la modernidad.* Madrid: CIS, 2002.

Bettelli, Maurizio. "Mediterraneo & mediterraneità: il senso di appartenenza. The Mediterranean: a sense of belonging." www.fiori.cc/pdf/mag0503/ing/3.pdf (08/10/03).

Centro de Cooperación del Mediterráneo. El Programa de areas protegidas: la mediterraneidad en marcha, in: http://www.iucn.org/places/medoffice/Noticias/mediterreneidad.htm (03/10/03).

Featherstone, Mike & Lash, Scott (eds). "Introduction." *Spaces of Culture. City-Nation-World,* London/Thousand Oaks/New Delhi: SAGE, 1999. 1-13.

Kellner, Douglas. "Popular culture and the construction of postmodern identities." Lash, Scott/Friedman, Jonathan (eds.). *Modernity & Identity.* Oxford UK/Cambridge USA: Blackwell, 1992. 141-177.

Léothaud, Gilles and Lortat-Jacob, Bernard (w.y.). "La voix méditerranéenne: une identité problematique". *La vocalité dans les pays d'Europe méridionale et dans le bassin méditerranéen.* Actes du colloque de La Napoule (06), 2 et 3

mars 2000. Textes réunis par Luc Charles-Dominique et Jérôme Cler, Saint-Jouin-De-Milly: Modal Éditions, 2000. 9-14.

Loopuyt, Marc (w.y.), "Mare Nostrum, comment nous tenir?" *La vocalitée dans les pays d'Europe méridionale et dans le bassin méditerranéen.* Actes du colloque de La Napoule (06), 2 et 3 mars 2000. Textes réunis par Luc Charles-Dominique et Jérôme Cler, Saint-Jouin-De-Milly: Modal Éditions, 2000. 81-92.

Maison Méditerranéenne des Sciences de l'Homme. Université de Provence, Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, Université d'Aix-Marseille. *Un réseau thématique sur l'ensemble europ-méditerranéen (5ème PCRD),* http.//www.mmsh.univ.aix.fr/default.asp?action=progeurope&page=02reseauthematique (03/10/03).

Première Proclamation des chefs-d'œeuvres du patrimoine oral et immatériel de l'humanité, may 18, 2001, UNESCO, Paris, 2001.

Proclamation des chefs-d'œuvre de patrimoine oral et immatÈriel de l'humanité. Guide pour la présentation des dossiers de candidature, UNESCO, Paris, 2001.

Programa Sócrates. Comenius Acción 1. Proyectos Educativos Europeos.http://www.mec.es/sgpe/socrates/proy0028.htm (03/10/03).

Recommendation on the Safeguarding of Traditional Culture and Folklore. Adopted by the General Conference at its twenty-fifth session, Paris, 15 November 1989. http://www.folklife.si.edu/unesco/1989Recommendation.htm (08/10/03).

Robertson, Roland. "Glokalisierung: Homogeneität und Heterogeneität in Raum und Zeit." Beck, Ulrich (ed.). *Perspektiven der Weltgesellschaft,* Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp, 1998. 192-220.

Steingress, Gerhard. "El flamenco como patrimonio cultural o una construcción artificial más de la identidad andaluza." *Anduli. Revista de Ciencias Sociales* 1 (2002): 43-64.

Loredana Kun

THE STATUS OF WOMEN IN GRAECO-ROMAN SOCIETY

The prevalent theme found within several literary masterpieces in Greek and Roman literature is the representation and status of women, which is both narrowly defined and rigid in nature. There is a tendency to depict women as weak, irrational and inferior beings, and a world of possibilities for them is in fact a world of limitations. They are represented as being dependent on men who exert their male authority and rule, imposing patriarchal restrictions that confine women within submissive and marginalized positions.

There was already controversy regarding the role of women since ancient times. The famed Greek philosopher Plato recognized women's remarkable nature and wisdom; he believed that they are capable of participating in diverse matters as well as contributing to the enrichment of society. Plato's student Aristotle did not share this view. He viewed women in a negative light, seeing them as being mutilated or incomplete man, and claiming that they lacked vital heat and intellect. This perspective and the path of female subordination would become ever-present in patriarchal societies and especially in the society and culture of the Mediterranean.

By examining the subordinate role and the position of women in Mediterranean society and its literary texts, I would like to emphasize a human drama-tragedy that is created by female protagonists in literature as they challenge restrictions by expressing their own wishes and choices despite the oppressive environment. The personal experiences of women in the selected texts will provide an internal view of the external historical reality, revealing the political, religious, and social circumstances that restrained and dominated women's life.

For centuries, dominating men were controlling, punishing and abusing women in Mediterranean society. The specific morality and unwritten laws during that time required an intensive standard of female inferiority, innocence, modesty, obedience and suffering. Women were represented as being in need of a strong and harsh guidance, which was always exercised by an older dominating male figure, such as father, an older brother, or husband. Male dominance was cemented, since men unlike women, men were considered to be rational and capable adults. The revelation of women's unimportance and the confirmation of men's powerful and dominating role were endless-

ly made apparent everyday life of Mediterranean society.

There is a continuous stereotypical gender representation in the context of society and literary texts. Women are primarily portrayed according to their traditional roles and are typically placed within a domestic setting. This reality is affirmed by the tendency to depict females as the housewife and homemaker, mother or girlfriend, thus perpetuating certain dominant representational stereotypes. Women's role and their personal autonomy were never equal to that of men, and consequently they tried to oppose this enforced inferiority.

In Homer's *Odyssey,* Penelope demonstrates the enforced restricted position by being exclusively known as the wife of Odysseus and mother of Telemachos. She is not considered in terms of her own individuality, but her identity is instead dependent on the relation to her husband and son. Consequently, her significance is confined to the role of the faithful wife and loving mother while her activities are limited correspondingly. Penelope is compelled to stay within her domestic setting and to remain faithful while patiently awaiting her husband's twenty-year return. She is considered to be the heart of the *oikos,* and it is her responsibility to maintain a harmonious marriage and household. However, not only is Penelope constricted to this obligation through virtue and moral, she is even physically enclosed in this role by the overpowering palace on Ithaca.

Penelope's familial role is confirmed by Agamemnon's opinion as he considers her to be the loyal wife and the key to the family unit. He expresses this to Odysseus, whom he finds fortunate in having "...a wife endowed with great virtue/How good was proved the heart of blameless Penelope" (Homer 11. 193-194). Penelope is the faithful wife who respects her husband and the institution of marriage, always remembering her eternal "philos"- her husband, friend, and love, Odysseus. Penelope's virtuous nature is captured by her contrast to Agamemnon's wife Clytemnestra who was responsible for his murder. Unlike Penelope, Clytemnestra is an adulteress, and her disloyalty and disrespect towards her husband is characteristic of women who cannot be trusted. Clytemnestra differs greatly from Penelope, as is demonstrated by the statement: "Not so did the daughter of Tyndareos fashion her evil/deeds, when she killed her wedded lord...to make evil the reputation of womankind, even for one whose acts are virtuous." (Homer 11. 199-202) Although Penelope is seen as a loyal wife, the figure of Clytemnestra creates the impression that women contain potential for evil and mistrust. The juxtaposition of Penelope and Clytemnestra creates the contrast between extreme goodness and extreme evil, revealing the distinction between the virtuous and dishonorable wife, since the former maintains the family unit, while the latter destroys it.

The prevalent characterization that conforms to a traditional per-

spective is further interconnected to the depiction of women as domestic and domesticated creatures in Greek and Roman society, which replicates the normative or ideal social order of the nuclear family. As a result, female characters are made to suffer both socially and individually if they dare to transcend the fixed gender roles. These two interwoven notions are exhibited in Sophocles' tragedy *Antigone*. Since women in Greco-Roman worlds were responsible for upholding family values, it was Antigone's traditional and domestic obligation to conduct Polynices' burial rites. Laudably, Antigone reveals her perpetual devotion to family values by appealing to "the great unwritten, unshakable traditions" (Sophocles, 374) that uphold her allegiance as *philia* and by unceasingly acknowledging her familial duty and respect for her *oikos* when firmly stating "I will bury him myself" (Sophocles, 363). However, Graeco-Roman societies expected women to be docile and submissive like Antigone's sister Ismene and encouraged them to act according to their fixed social placement. Therefore, Ismene obediently bowed to Creon's edict forbidding Polynices' burial and attempted to dissuade Antigone from her act of rebellion since she knew the harsh consequences and suffering that awaited a woman who dared to surpass her predetermined role. Although Ismene respected Creon's rule, Antigone adhered to her domestic duty yet suffered in the end. Her suffering was caused by her defiance to the established social position as dictated by Creon's rule and by her transcendence of this societal role through her manifestation of manly courage. This courage is represented by Antigone's firmness, determination, and devotion to her beliefs; treasuring *physis* or 'natural laws' and following divine law, she remains fearless in the face of authority and punishment.

The representation of women as highly emotional and unstable beings who are prone to losing self-control, versus male dominance and rational control over the life-world is a notion further reinforced by the texts in which females are depicted as being illogical and irrational while males are depicted as possessing both logic and rationality. This restrictive qualification is represented in Euripides' *Medea* by the protagonist herself. Following the divorce, Medea undergoes an emotional transformation that is classified by a progression from suicidal despair to sadistic fury. Her instability and impulsiveness are captured by her destructive reaction to Jason's betrayal that includes a series of murders and even the horrific murder of her own children.

Medea's irrationality is embedded in the pleasure she derives from watching Jason suffer the loss of their children, one that outweighs her own remorse at killing them. This is revealed by her exclamation, "How did they die? You will delight me twice as much again if you say they died in agony." (Euripides, 98, 1134-35) This unfavourable portrayal creates the binary opposition to the depiction of men as exhibited by

Euripides' characterization of Jason. Instead of being represented as an emotional, irrational, and destructive Barbarian, he epitomizes the quality of an admirable Greek, rationality.

The irrationality of a woman is also reflected by Clytaemnestra and her revenge in Aeschylus' tragedy *Agamemnon*. Clytaemnestra is vengeful, planning to kill Agamemnon upon his return. The desire to kill him is driven by her anger for having sacrificed their daughter Iphigenia ten years earlier when he was leaving for battle. This was done in order to appease Artemis' anger, as the goddess sent contrary sailing winds in order to prevent Agamemnon and his companions from arriving at Troy. In order to ensure success, Agamemnon, :"With no thought more than as if a beast had died, when his ranged pasture swarmed with the deep fleece of flocks, he slaughtered like a victim his own child (51)." Considering the fact that Agamemnon sacrificed their daughter, and then proceeded to return home with the concubine Cassandra, it can be seen why wrath and fury were fueled to an even greater level within Cassandra. Deciding to take matters into her own hands, and acting like a man, she challenged the established patriarchal order and acted upon her own free will. She fought for justice on her own terms.

She murders her husband and the slave girl, Cassandra, practically rejoicing in the details of the murder scene. This is exhibited by her description of the episode, "Thus he went down, and the life struggled out of him, and as he died he spattered me with the dark red and violent driven rain of bitter savoured blood to make me glad," (1. 1387-1391). Clytaemnestra attempts to justify and reason her husband's murder as being the will of gods, but the pleasure she appears to have derived from this action does not coincide with it being an action inspired by divine sanction alone. Driven by hatred, Clytaemnestra committed the murders without considering the consequences, thus executing them with no feelings of guilt or remorse.

What is beyond any reason is that after murdering her husband, Clytaemnestra also proceeds to murder the slave girl, Cassandra, whom Agamemnon had taken against her will as his mistress during his journeys.There is no reasonable explanation for the murder of this innocent girl who had no say in what Agamemnon chose to do with her. Aegisthus, Clytaemnestra's lover, is in fact the mastermind behind Agamemnon's murder. Although he does not commit the act of murder itself, he has great hatred for Agamemnon as a result of his father, Atreus, feeding his brothers to his father, Thyestes (56-57). Aegisthus' reasoning behind his decision to murder is misguided in that Agamemnon holds no responsibility whatsoever for the horrid decision that his father decided to commit against his brother in the past. The queen's motives are compounded when Agamemnon returns with his concubine, Cassandra. The capabilities of a resentful woman are clear as

Clytaemnestra is presented as cunning, manipulative and dangerous. She is deceitful as she addresses him and the people of Argos by first announcing her love for him, while in her mind, it is only part of an elaborate scheme for his murder, "I take no shame to speak aloud before you all the love I bear my husband," (I. 856-857). When Clytaemnestra is found standing over the two dead bodies of Agamemnon and Cassandra, she explains that she has been dissembling, waiting, and plotting her revenge. Clytaemnestra seems to enjoy describing the details of the murder "Thus he went down, and the life struggled out of him, and as he died he spattered me with the dark red and violent driven rain of bitter savoured blood to make me glad," (1. 1387-1391). Once again the spiteful nature of a wronged woman is seen to put revenge above all else. The Chorus is shocked by her words and behaviour, "We stand here stunned. How can you speak this way, with mouth so arrogant, to vaunt above your fallen lord?" (1. 1399-1400). Clytaemnestra's pride, lack of remorse, and thirst for revenge detract from her argument that Iphigenia's death demanded her husband's "by my Child's justice driven to fulfillment, by her Wrath and Fury, to whom I sacrificed this man," (1. 1432-1433). Clytaemnestra tries reasoning that her husband's murder was the will of gods, but judging from the pleasure she derived, she did not act out of divine sanction alone. Furthermore, there are the prophecies of Cassandra that foreshadow the murders, "We two must die, yet die not vengeless by the gods," (1.1277-1279). Clytaemnestra's brutal actions and reasoning were inspired by a mind clouded by hate and pride. They were committed without consideration for the consequences of her actions; by murdering her husband and his concubine Cassandra she had furthered the curse on the house of Atreus, and showed her "male" actions in the hands of woman.

Agamemnon's arrogant behaviour leads to his downfall and is partially a reason for his eventual murder. Saying that his will is everything and has to be exercised and shown without soft thoughts and deeds, he triggers Clytaemnestra's brutal reactions. His *hubris* or excessive pride cost him his life.

Linked to this emotional and irrational representation is the portrayal of women in Roman literature as disabled and dysfunctional beings. Dido, a figure of both passion and volatility, captures this rigid depiction in Virgil's *Aeneid* since love for her is practically a madness or disease. When in love, Dido is not familiarized with measure; instead, she is acquainted with extremes, loving her Aeneas madly, passionately, irrationally, and obsessively. She is not just in love; she is consumed and overpowered by this insane and violent force. Even Virgil's language depicts how love's power is like a sickness and a preoccupation beyond her control "Flames devoured her soft heart's flesh; the wound

in her breast was wordless, but alive." (Virgil, IV, 66-7) Almost bordering on insanity following Aeneas' rejection and betrayal since she is incompatible with his Roman destiny, Dido madly finds herself writhing between fierce love and bitter anger, a fury that erupts into a savage and deranged emotion. This is confirmed by the statement "Filled with madness and prisoner of her pain, she was determined to die." (Virgil, IV, 474-5) Although she is originally depicted as being sane and possessing rationality by being the leader of her nation, love renders her dysfunctional to the extent that she never resurfaces to her dignified state and ends her misery by suicide.

Literature at times is a reflection of existing social roles, ideals, and ideologically normative power relations. Mirroring the values and beliefs of the Mediterranean society, it becomes a literary recreation of the existing and surrounding social reality. The female protagonists of the selected masterpieces capture this notion, as they are portrayed according to the values of the Graeco-Roman society.

York University

Works Cited

Aeschylus, *Agamemnon*. Greek Tragedies: Volume I. Edited by David Grene, and Richmond Lattimore. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1947.

Euripides, *Medea*. Translated by R. Warner Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1992.

Homer, *Odyssey*. Translated by R. Lattimore . New York: Harper Collins Publishers, 1967.

Kun, Loredana ,*The Poetics of Symbolism*. Split-Geneva: HSD, 2004.

Sophocles, *Antigone*. Greek Tragedies Vol I, edited by D. Grene and R. Lattimore. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1991.

Vergil, *The Aeneid*. Translated by Frank O. Copley. New York: Macmillan Publishing Company, 1965.

Tina Pereda Bazán

THE BODY AS WEAPON IN *INSOLACIÓN* BY EMILIA PARDO

Recent literary theories define the body as a cultural product, as an entity, or as a source of profuse meanings. Regardless of the genre examined, these contemporary literary theories assert that the body functions as a key to unlock the textual message. The body, in its most sweeping semantic definition, can simultaneously become one or several things, replete with meaning and representative of a multiplicity of genres; in literature, for instance, one finds the heroic body, the tragic body, the sacred body, as well as the historic and the mythical one.

Many of the studies on the body, whether in poetry or in narrative, are informed by psychoanalytical theories advanced by Sigmund Freud, Melanie Klein, and Jacques Lacan as they assert that the body offers the foundation of the symbolic and even of language itself. These psychoanalytical theories conceive of the body as being part of a cultural crux with itself and with its other; paradoxically, the body then becomes "something" external, residing out of written language but that all the same language itself strives to transmit. According to these theories, the body, be it one's own or that of another provides not only pleasure ("jouissance") but also knowledge and power.

Still, other critics assert that the body-as-text is a concept that in recent years has been disseminated with ever-growing interest, especially by cultures already marginalized. Essentially, mainstream critics assume that marginality theorists presume, too readily, when they define identities according to the external appearance of the body; furthermore, most traditional critics presuppose that peripheral authors appropriate the body to express intimate aspects of desire, of passion, of emptiness, or of solitude and that they do so in an attempt to redefine their own subjectivities. These same critics argue that scholars concerned with culture on the margins arbitrarily interpret the body, and they assign to it the capacity of being read as a text, a book, a song, a painting or any other media upon which one writes but also one from which one can derive meaning through the act of reading. That is to say, mainstream criticism accuses cultural critics who deal with peripheral culture of deeming the body to be a cultural space already inscribed with meaning, and which others need to read so as to understand their own marginalized subjectivities.

In reality, there are several ways in which one could approach the study of the body as text. The first reading describes the inscription of

an individual upon birth by markers such as race, color, kinship or other immutable aspects. These corporeal inscriptions do not acquire great meaning until they begin to be interpreted or read by another, when in fact they become cultural prescriptions. Subsequently, these cultural meanings begin to attain positive or negative cultural annotations. This line of thought reveals that more often than not these inscriptions are displaced on to the theme of sexuality; in fact, these corporal inscriptions almost exclusively translate into sexuality. However, rendering the diverse inscriptions of race, color, etc. as sexuality thus devalues many other aspects of the individual's vital experience like level of education, socialization, intelligence, socio-economic influence or other essential characteristics.

Not surprisingly, the twenty first century brings forth many unusual forms of body-writing that are meant to alter the body, for instance, tattoos, mutilations, piercings, as well as possible alterations in skin texture and pigmentation, hair color, and so forth. It is a conspicuous and visual form used to inscribe one's own body with the expectation that others will read and interpret it. One may want, and may need at times, to alter or to modify the physicality of one's features; nonetheless, no one can ensure that her own bodily inscription will be interpreted as it was at first intended. On the contrary, the social order typically will rewrite and interpret the "editorialized" bodily text in ways that truly may depart from the original, deliberate individual inscription.

As of late, the study of the body has acquired great currency mostly because of new schools of thought that try to reincorporate the theme of the subject in theoretical productions, that is to say, to render the subject's body as language, in the sense that covers various systems of differentiated signs: the notion of the textual body and the body as an compilation of various texts, either cultural, literary, artistic, ecological-environmental, or socio-economic. The body-as-text, to a large extent derives from feminist theories (Butler 1990 Jaggar and Bordo 1989). The considerations of body-as-text has also influenced anthropological theories of recent decades, particularly in the interpretive schools of postmodernism. What is more, the body-as-text, as it is applied to genre, is presented through different analyses with symbolic meanings that mostly conform to a given historical context; the body becomes a medium for possible symbolic, ideological constructions of the socio-economy at hand.

Towards the end of the nineteenth century, when patriarchal culture predominated, the textual inscriptions of the female body could be interpreted as aggressive, graphic texts, however veiled, and made available to a culturally prescribed reader. However, these texts still demanded, through cultural signs that were offered as disguise, as subterfuge, a different reading, as is the case of *Insolación* (1889) by Emilia Pardo Bazán (1851-1921).

As aforementioned, the body has its own language and it is a vehicle with the potential to communicate itself to a given cultural milieu. Ordinarily, it tries to communicate notions that are somewhat difficult or impossible to articulate openly or through conventional methods. The body requires that the reader explore it as a text; in fact, as a text that stands as a symbol of that which itself cannot or should not be articulated with clarity. It is the reader's task to extract the unspoken states of anxiety, emptiness, frustration, desire, whose open and direct articulation would not be acceptable in a literary society that represses the female, a literary society that keeps the woman writer "in check" and thus a victim of a double standard of a social or political nature. Many anthropologists, among them Drawing, (Davis and Low 1989, Jankins, 1996) have concluded that a great spectrum of psychosomatic and physiological symptoms exist simply as a means by which the body reveals that which in itself cannot be expressed by the subject: pain, fatigue, anxiety, and fear. These somatic expressions become then another dialect, and in the case of Pardo Bazán's *Insolación*, other articulations are represented: drowsiness, dizziness, infirmity, fainting, and nausea. Pardo Bazán's character, Asís, Marquesa de Andrade, experiences each of these somatic agonies, which are only readable through her narrating body-text.

The skill of reading the body and physiology was already considered a science in the eigteenth century. This was a science that interpreted human character and individual personality by virtue of being able to analyze a person's physical appearance, righteousness, and even intelligence. This science was based on the belief that external body signs would reveal the internal condition of an individual. Thus, eighteenth-century science claimed that by observing external characteristics one could ascertain elements that resided within the subject, such as an individual's passions and desires.The body acted as a reliable metaphor and as a fundamental conduit of the human experience. Therefore, one must consider this skill of reading the body as an intimate system that the narrator uses to establish a sort of mute dialogue, not necessarily abstracted but rather more tangible, as if it were an incarnation of the mind/body dichotomy. The narrator reveals her physical experiences by means of her body, its reactions, its gestures, and its emotions. One will find that Asís tries to narrate through her somatized body, thus re-creating a text that one actually experiences, in the flesh, and one that could very well be described as a "somatic text."

Emilia Pardo Bazán faced enormous challenges as a writer. It was especially difficult for a woman to write at the end of the nineteenth century; in fact, it had not been easy before her time as it would not be later either. For instance, Pardo Bazán's contemporaries, Benito Pérez Galdós, Leopoldo Alas "Clarín", and José María Pereda, among others,

did not approve of women authors, especially one such as Pardo Bazán who defiantly dared to undertake what they considered perilous themes. Social pressures and the overt censure Pardo Bazán received from her literary peers resulted in an authorial anxiety that was directly related to gender concerns.

It is imperative to re-read *Insolación* as bloodhounds, as tracking detectives, and as *reading* detectives who seek textual tracks and traces over Asís' body; reading between the lines, reading between spasmodic and vague textual traits that serve as both underlining and superscript. Hence, one finds a text that has as crux an interaction of mind, body and text; indeed, it is a body-text that acts as a "medium" which transmits information at times through signs and at others through symptoms.

Emilia Pardo Bazán fashions her central female character, Asís, in relation to Asís's own body, which also acts as a metaphor; Pardo Bazán thus establishes a peculiar connection between author-body-text in order to reveal her character's vital sexuality. The author achieves this through different literary techniques such as irony, humor, and through the majestic use of several narrators, each with a different voice, and all of whom claim a different "I". All this conceals a subversive yet subtle subtext that traps the heroine in *Insolación* inside her own womanly body.

Indeed, the study of the body as language comprises various systems of differentiated signs and the textual body assembles several socio-economic texts within a given configuration of time and space. In *Insolación*, Asís's textual body speaks through a series of signs that transform into a series of somatic codes: the sharp pain that she feels in her temples, the asphyxia that suffocates her and in which she seems to drown, the dizziness that invades her, the blackouts that blind her, drowsiness, nausea, the tremendous sense of aimlessness, as if she were adrift in the high seas, in an enormity of open waters without having a single thing to which she can cling in order to steady herself. However the Marquesa de Andrade feels obliged to explain that all her symptoms come as a result, without a doubt, of an overexposure to the sun, to which she is not accustomed, or perhaps of the delicious wine that she consumes with Pacheco at the fair of San Isidro near the Manzanares River. These are new times and new spaces unbeknownst to this Galician woman, who finds herself far away from her native land, Galicia, and in peripheral spaces never before explored by a lady Marchioness.

At first, Asís is infringed upon by conservative mores, yet she gradually surrenders to her own desires, while at the same time she disrupts the canon established by her patriarchal society. She succumbs to the irresistible attraction she feels for the man from Cádiz, whom she barely knows. Pressed by her own sensuality, she leans her head on Pacheco's shoulder as she allows him to lead her down winding paths

at the seemingly never-ending fair. In reality, she feels transported by his touch, his unique and unmistakable smell, and how it feels to have her hand in his. Asís seeks an excuse for her sexual conduct and she finds it in the sun, which becomes a mediated sign of her desire.

Since language is a crucial aspect of intelligence, and the processes of understanding and reading a text are a system of coherent interpretation, as a good detective, as the tracking bloodhound, the reader of *Insolación* has to discover those implicit signifiers to make them explicit; the body's language thus becomes the semiotic course by which one can penetrate the textual message. Pardo Bazán creates a female character, Asís de Taboada, widowed, marchioness, thirty something, and rich, who abandons her native Vigo for a Madrid that is seductive, distant, full of possibilities, and where she finds herself surrounded by unfamiliar and strange people. Her trip to Madrid is already in itself a metaphor of her break with the canon; it is a journey on which she must embark in order to experience her own life. It is precisely in Madrid, far from her beloved Vigo, where Asís will meet a charming man from Cádiz, a social inferior who will end up seducing her and loving her. He is an Andalusian whom, by a twist of fate, she meets in the parlors of yet another Marchioness of Sahagún; a man who, despite not conforming to the social constrains to which she is accustomed, transforms her life. Asís gradually frees herself from her own shackles while her own body, sensual and sensitive, finds its own space inside and outside of itself. Nevertheless, her mind cannot easily diminish or rationalize what has happened as she constantly seeks excuses to explain her conduct to Father Urdax, her spiritual father in Galicia.

Clearly, the body exists as an integral element that straddles between the conscious existence and the material one. What the theorist Elizabeth Grosz (1990) calls "the metaphor of the textualized body" not because the body is itself inscribed but rather because its gesture, movements, postures and other physical expressions exhibit power within a specific culture.

Insolación was written at a moment in history when literature was greatly influenced by the rules and norms introduced by naturalism. When Emilia Pardo Bazán creates her female character, Asís de Taboada, Marquesa de Andrade, she debates with herself, her thoughts constantly oscillating between dichotomous notions, between reason and passion, between mind and body, always bipartite elements, binary opposites in nature. Asís herself states:

> [...] lo que no sucede en un año sucede en un día. No hay que darle vueltas. Tú has sido hasta el presente una señora intachable; bien; una perfecta viuda; conforme; te has llevado en peso tus dos añitos de luto (cosa tanto más meritoria cuanto que, seamos francos, últimamente ya

> necesitabas alguna virtud para querer a tu tío, esposo y señor natural, el insigne Marqués de Andrade, con sus bigotes pintados y sus achaques, fístulas o lo que fuesen).[1]
>
> [...] whatever might not happen in a year happens in a day. One must not give it too much thought. You have been until now an impeccable lady; well; a perfect widow; compliant; you have carried with dignity your two years of mourning (something with much more merit since, let's be honest, as of late you were in need of some virtue to love your uncle, husband and master, the well-known Marquis of Andrade, with his painted moustache, his ailments, his sores, or whatever those things may have been.] (46)

The reader is drawn into Asís Taboada's conscious world as she attempts to free herself from her own taboos. When Asís, instead of going to mass, as she had initially intended, decides to go to the Fair of San Isidro with Pacheco, Asís is spellbound by a social space to which she does not belong. The buggy ride allows the Marchioness to observe a bona fide parade of folkloric figures that seem to belong in a Goya painting. *Majos* and *majas*, brawls, knives being thrown, gypsies, all of it merging with the smell of fried buns, fritters, and jasmines seem to affect Asís in a manner akin to the loss of her senses and everything becomes bewildering, blurry, not only for her but also for the reader. As Asís explains: "mis pupilas destellaban lumbre, y en mis mejillas se podía encender un fósforo," "sólo experimentaba una animación agradable, con la lengua suelta, los sentidos excitados, el espíritu en volandas y gozoso el corazón", ["my pupils were ablaze, and my cheeks were so hot that a match could be lit on them" "I only experienced a pleasant liveliness, my tongue had loosened, my senses were delighted, my spirit in flight and joyful my heart."] (81). A little further on, the protagonist confesses: "Notaba yo cierta ligereza insólita en piernas y pies; me figuraba que se había suprimido el peso de mi cuerpo, y en vez de andar, creía deslizarme sobre la tierra" ["I noticed a certain unusual lightness in my legs and feet; I reckoned that my body had become weightless, and, instead of walking, I felt myself gliding"] (84).

A good detective/reader recognizes the inscriptions of a text-body-text when Asís Taboada declares: "se me puso en la cabeza que me había caído en el mar, mar caliente, que hervía [sic] a borbotones, y en el cual flotaba yo dentro de un botecillo chico como una cáscara de nuez" ["what came to mind was a sensation that I had fallen into the sea, a hot sea that boiled impetuously and in which I floated, inside a tiny vessel as small as a nut shell."] (84). At this juncture in the narrative, Asís's body unleashes a challenge; through a somatic manifestation, her body speaks against the suppression of the woman's mark. In other words, her body deplores the social, cultural, and literary canonical suppression of the feminine; Asís's body reveals how the woman's

inscription has been suppressed, remaining silent, null and void within a society, a culture, and a literary canon that refuses its mark.

Indeed, the act of writing and the subsequent act of reading are ways by which a woman documents her body. It is imperative that the readers identify and consider these traces of the body in women's writing as a transhistorical phenomenon, particularly if one is to take into account the era in which Pardo Bazán's novel appeared. For instance, when Asís, feeling happy in the company of Pacheco, rests her head on his shoulder, she looks at the setting sun in the distance, and reacts abruptly:

> No tuve tiempo de reflexionar en situación tan rara. No me lo permitió el afán, la fatiga inexplicable que me entró de súbito. Era como si me tirasen del estómago y de las entrañas hacia fuera con un garfio para arrancármelas por la boca. Llevé las manos a la garganta y al pecho y gemí." 89. ["I did not have time to reflect, finding myself in such a strange situation. Preventing me from doing so were the feelings of unrest, the baffling fatigue that suddenly invaded me. It felt as if someone were pulling me by my stomach and yanking my bowels in an outward motion, as if to rip both from my body, with a hook, and through my mouth. I covered my throat and my chest with my hands, and I moaned. (89).

Such descriptions seem to evoke the methods used during the Inquisition. The reader is not given much more information, and if he wants to know more, she must deduce it because the protagonist only offers cut-off phrases:

> me dominaba una modorra invencible." "En medio de mi sopor empecé a sentir cierta comezón...entreabrí los ojos y con gran sorpresa vi el agua del mar, pero no la verde y plomiza del Cantábrico, sino la del Mediterráneo, azul y tranquila. Las pupilas de Pacheco, como ustedes se habrán imaginado" ["an unshakable drowsiness overwhelmed me" "In the midst of my stupor I began to feel a certain itch...I half-opened my eyes and with great surprise I spotted the sea water, but not the green and gray one of the Cantabrian, but that of the Mediterranean, blue and tranquil. Pacheco's pupils, as you will probably have guessed. (90).

In this way, Asís's body language, which is predominantly somatic, becomes textual and the text itself becomes corporeal; her mind is bound by her body.

According to theories advanced by Foucault, Helene Cixous and Jacques Derrida the body can be read as an axis of intersections of different discourses and of linked transformations; their theories revisit the Cartesian division of body/mind, both soul and mind imprisoned within the body. In Asís's case, imprisonment becomes release, and her body speaks through a multiplicity of imagery that defies a socio-historical moment that suppresses the feminine, that erases a woman's

trace. Thus Pardo Bazán positions her character on a crucial path to cultural irruption, Asís fulfills a desire/need to position herself as a corporeal presence, to leave a mark, a trace in regions of claimed sexuality that have been until now veiled and forbidden by an autocratic patriarchal structure. Writing, then, becomes an aesthetic space of resistance, of rupture, and of subversion. Asís's expressions of pain, sicknesses, dizziness, and asphyxia are, in reality, an aggressive textual incision that articulates her erotic desire and the irresistible attraction she feels for Pacheco. Transhistorically, woman has been socialized first to be a good daughter and second to be a good wife and mother. Yet it is precisely the woman who should negotiate her preferences and her limitations in a suffocating patriarchal world. Some have argued that the mere act of writing already is an act of desire that provides the possibility for change (Cixous 1976). Still, writing is done in binary terms: body/text, knowledge/experience, theory/practice.

Both Nietzsche and Freud present theoretical structures that challenge one another regarding the binary relation of mind/body. Freud relies upon neuro-scientific speculations while Nietzsche supports his philosophy with language and metaphorical signs. One of the most important aspects in Freudian studies is the interpretation of dreams. Narrated in the third person, a segment in *Insolación* tells of one of Asís's dreams; it brilliantly illustrates the relation body-text: "Bregando con la imaginación y la memoria se quedó traspuesta. No era dormir profundo sino una especie de sonambulismo, en que las percepciones del mundo exterior se amalgamaban con el delirio de la fantasía. ["Coping with her imagination and her memory, she remained transposed. It was not a deep sleep but rather a sort of somnambulism, in which perceptions of the exterior world became amalgamated with an elated fantasy] (162). Soon after, the narrator invites us to enter another of Asís's dreams:

> El tren adelantaba unas veces bufando y pitando otras con perezoso cuneo. [...] El polvillo de carbón entraba en remolinos, o en ráfagas violentas, cegando, desvaneciendo, asfixiando [...] Mientras la señora gemía, el inmenso foco de sol ardía más implacable. [...] ¡Que me abraso! ¡Que me abraso! ¡Oh deleite!, manantiales, cascaditas, riachuelos, mientras allá abajo caudaloso y profundo corre el río Sil. ["The train advanced, at times snorting and whistling, at others lazily rocking from side to side [...] Coal dust came in swirls, or in violent gusts, blinding, dissolving, suffocating [...] While the lady moaned, the immense beam of sun burned much more implacably [...] I am on fire! I am on fire! Oh sweet delight!, springs, cascades, streams, while down at the bottom the River Sil gushes large"] (164).

The imagery is indisputably sexual: a train that penetrates the tunnel, the rhythmic swaying, and finally a refreshing spurt of rain that

floods Asís's body with utter pleasure and joy. Hence, the Marchioness of Andrade's relaxing dream is pregnant with erotic connotations; it allows the reader to apprehend Asís' sexual desire, her anxiety, and her behaviour when faced with the circumstances brought about by "southern" Pacheco. All kinds of nonverbal communication propel an important system of negotiated signs so that the reader can interpret a new text through Asís's sexualized body.

Insolación is an excellent example of textual/corporeal language: at times there are gestures, a turn of the head, postures, looks, glances, hand movements, and at other times there are dreams. The protagonist's body is an effective catalyst by which the reader enters and interprets the text, the narration. From the beginning of the novel, one realizes that Emilia Pardo Bazán creates a character in which the body's significance is well established. And she does so writing within a culture that erases the materiality of a woman's body, which gives precedence to the projected image to the detriment of a woman's corporeality. In Asís, Pardo Bazán offers the reader a woman already transgressing the time-honoured canon: her character freely travels, alone, from Vigo to Madrid with the only company that her trunk and her maid provide. Behind her she has left her much-beloved Spanish countryside but, above all, she leaves behind her relatives and her daughter of whom she seldom speaks and when she does, only alludes to her fragile nature, and her poor health that demands special care.

When the Marchioness of Taboada arrives in Madrid, she fully transforms her outward image and begins to inscribe her body with new texts. She has no use for tattoos, piercings, mutilations or Botox injections with which to inscribe her body, but does so with what was available to her at that time. She dresses differently, and changes her hairstyle. She moves in new geographical spaces that did not correspond to her social standing. Her transgression surpasses all limits when she chooses to befriend a man, Pacheco, who readily admits to being an indolent, womanizing, wandering good-for-nothing. Indeed, when Asís asks him: "¿De modo que no te avergüenzas de ser un hombre inútil, un mequetrefe, un cero a la izquierda?" ["so, are you not ashamed of being such a useless man, a busybody, a good-for-nothing?"] Pacheco immediately responds, "¿Y a ti qué te importa eso lucerito? ¿Soy inútil para quererte? ¿Has resuelto no enamorarte sino de tipos que mangoneen y anden agarraos a la casaca de algún ministro?" [And why would you care about that, lucerito? Am I useless when loving you? Are you determined to fall in love only with men that meddle and cling to the uniform of some public servant?"] (136).

The protagonist breaks with all of her society's established norms. Pacheco knows how to read her body well, even better than she can, and he reads her as both subject and object, and as easily as one would

a legible and accessible text; Asís's body is decipherable, intelligible not only to Pacheco, her lover, but also to the reader. Asís's somatic articulations spell out her desires and her symptoms are codes by which the reader deciphers her sexuality. Therefore, traits such as desire, impulse, or motives, not always easily discernible, but they are for Pacheco and the good bloodhound, the good detective/reader of *Insolación*.

Insolación invites a careful reading and an understanding of the relation between reader-body-text that necessitates an emotional, intellectual, and above all, a cultural interpretation of the text. Irony and humour will be the principal tools that Pardo Bazán utilizes in order playfully to disguise and unveil her protagonist. While striving to interpret Asís's body-text, the reader is implicated. The combination of mind/text is analogous to the point of convergence of the text (written material) and the reader. The author's strategy is risky: offering as her main character a woman that resists the cultural codes of her era was, undoubtedly, a courageous attempt by the author. Especially since she had been censured for not respecting the moral principles of her times. Her male contemporaries, who considered her work to be a rebellious attempt and a threat to the canon, criticized her work harshly.

As readers, what is required of us is to have sufficient imagination and to possess the ability to suspend our belief in our own world in order better to enter the world that the author offers. Nevertheless, imagination also requires the use of referents. A good reader must recognize the socio-historical referents that restricted the literary creation. Not to do so would be tantamount to transposing 21st century values to Pardo Bazán's 19th century text. This peril is made easy by the ruses the author uses, which easily make the reading contemporary. As well, when the referent is a woman's body that is represented inside a text, the body-object is understood through the body-image the reader assigns it, thus forming a map of communication where the axes of sensations and actions are bound and intertwined. Emilia Pardo Bazán's novel, *Insolación*, offers its readers, regardless of their cultural, sociopolitical, or historical contexts, this wonderful opportunity.

Nazareth College of Rochester
Translated by Arleen Chiclana y González.
University of Michigan-Dearborn

Works Cited

Bordo, Susan. "The body and the reproduction of femininity: A feminist appropriation of Foucault." *Feminist reconstruction of being and knowing*. Ed. Jaggar, A., and S. Bordo. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 1989.

Butler, Judith, *Bodies that Matter: On the Discursive Limits of Sex*. Routledge, 1993.

——. *Gender Trouble: feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. Routledge, 1990.

Cixous, Helene. "The Laugh of the Medusa", Trad. K. Cohen and P. Cohen. in Elain Marks and Isabelle de Courtivron eds. *New French Feminism*. Brighton: Harvester, 1980.

Davis, D., and S. Low. *Gender, health and illness. The case of nerves.* New York: Hemisphere,1989.

Foucault, Michael. *The use of pleasure.* London: Penguin, 1992.

Freud, Sigmund. "Civilization and Its Discontents" in *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Freud.* Vol. XXI, trans. James Strachey, ed. London: The Hoggarth Press, 1930.

Jaggar, Alison M. and Susan Bordo. eds. *Gender/body/knowledge. Feminist reconstruction of being and knowing.* New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 1989.

Lacan, Jacques. *The Seminar of Jacques Lacan Book I: Freud's Papers or Techniques* 1953-1954. Ed. Jacques-Alain Miller. Trans. John Forrester. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1988.

Pardo Bazán, Emilia. *Insolación: Colección Austral.* Madrid: Espasa Calpe, 1991.

Said, Edward. *The Word, the Text, and the Critic,* Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1983.

Barrie Wharton

MASTERS AND SERVANTS; THE SPANISH CIVIL WAR IN EQUATORIAL GUINEA

For the majority of the general population, the African nation of Equatorial Guinea may be little more than an exotic African backwater, located somewhere behind the Congo. However, in recent years, it has begun to fill some column inches in the popular press, principally due to the implication in a coup attempt there of Mark Thatcher, a son of a former British Prime Minister.[1] Yet, the emergence of Equatorial Guinea as a significant player in twenty-first century world affairs may not be as surprising as currently considered, principally due to the discovery of vast deposits of oil in the country and its surrounding waters.[2] As a result of this burgeoning geo-political importance, the hitherto ostracized dictator Teodoro Obiang Nguema[3] and Equatorial Guinea have come in from the international cold in recent years and Malabo has a line of Western suitors wooing it and queueing up to share in the country's transformation. Indeed, one could even speculate on how the discovery of these oil deposits fifty years ago could have changed the course of not only Equatorial Guinea but, moreover, of Francoism and by extension, contemporary Spain.[4]

Spain is mentioned here not only for the purposes of this article but because, for almost all its modern history, Equatorial Guinea, or the colonial territories of Fernando Poo and Río Muni,[5] as they were previously

[1]This coup was originally planned for early 2004 but the plotters were arrested at Harare Airport in Zimbabwe in earlier and, in the ensuing trial, Sir Mark Thatcher was implicated as one of the masterminds behind the alleged coup plot.

[2]Indeed, Equatorial Guinea has been referred to be some commentators as "the new Kuwait".

[3]Obiang came to power after killing his uncle in a 1979 coup. Born in 1942, the President for life is referred to as "God" by his subjects. He received his military training in Spain at the elite Zaragoza academy, which was also attended by the current Spanish King, Juan Carlos I.

[4]For a comprehensive account of this period in Spain, see the recent Ross, C. *Spain 1812-1996*. London: Arnold, 2002.

[5]Throughout the course of this article, place names, except where explicitly stated, will be referred to in the context of the time-frame being discussed i.e. Spanish colonial names e.g. Fernando Poo and Río Muni will be predomi-

known, was ruled by Spain and Spain and the Spaniards remain the most powerful external influence in the political, economic and cultural life of its former colony.[6]Likewise, Equatorial Guinea also plays a vital role in contemporary Spanish history as one of Spain's last colonial outposts and the territory served as the *alma mater* for many of the most hardline and intransigent members of Franco's infamous *bunker* of the 1970's including Luis Carrero Blanco who had first served in Río Muni in 1927.[7]

Given the long history of Spanish involvement in Equatorial Guinea, there is an unusual dearth of literature on the subject and most studies have tended to concentrate on linguistic questions or on the development of an indigenous literary tradition in Spanish.[8] Although of clear importance, there has been very little academic work carried out on society or history in Equatorial Guinea before its independence from Spain in 1968 and in an attempt to redress this,[9] this article aims to focus on a hitherto untouched academic subject, the background to and

---

nantly used as the greater part of the article discusses the Spanish colonial period. However, the new name for Santa Isabel, Malabo is used when discussing Equatorial Guinea in a contemporary context.

[6] There is a dearth of objective or independent academic studies on the Spanish colonial experience in Equatorial Guinea but some excellent studies are Liniger-Goumaz, M. *Brève Histoire de la Guinée Équatoriale*. Paris: L'Harmattan, 1988 and Nerín, G. *Guinea Ecuatorial, historia en blanco y negro (hombres blancos y mujeres negras en Guinea Ecuatorial; 1843-1968)*. Barcelona: Ediciones Peninsula, 1997.

[7]Carrero Blanco was a close associate and intimate confidant of Franco Franco throughout the period of his dictatorship in Spain (1936-1975). Appointed prime minister by Franco in June 1973, he was killed by a car bomb on December 20th of the same year. Responsibility for this killing was claimed by the Basque separatist group, ETA.

[8]See for example Ndongo Bidyogo, D. *Antología de la literatura guineana*. Madrid: Ed. Nacional, 1984 and for an excellent survey of the fortunes of the Spanish language in Equatorial Guinea, Quilis Morales, A. and Casado-Fresnedillo, C. *La lengua española en Guinea Ecuatorial*. Madrid: Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia, 1995. Two more recent studies are Ngom Fayé, M. *"Literatura africana de expresión española." Cuadernos*, 3 (2003), Centro de Estudios Africanos de la Universidad de Murcia, Murcia, pp. 11-135 and his more recent Ngom Fayé, M, ed. *La recuperación de la memoria: creación cultural e identidad nacional en la literatura hispano-negroafricana*. Alcalá de Henares: Ed. Universidad de Alcalá de Henares, 2004.

[9]Amongst the few published works are Evuna Owono Asangono, A. *El proceso democrático de Guinea Ecuatorial*. Torrejón de Ardoz: Ed. Ceiba, 1994 and the older Ndongo Bidyogo, D. *Historia y tragedia de Guinea Ecuatorial*. Madrid, Ed. Cambio 16, 1977.

course of, the Spanish Civil War in Equatorial Guinea.[10] As Equatorial Guinea was an integral part of Spanish territory at the time, the trajectory of the war there provides a fascinating sideshow to the cataclysmic events in Spain that would shape the country's contemporary history. Furthermore, an analysis of how the war and its eventual outcome was viewed by the local population provides us with some very interesting insights and variations on the much-studied socio-political divisions of Civil War Spain and their roots.[11]

The Spanish Civil War will undoubtedly be remembered by history as one of the great tragedies of our time. A bitter and bloody conflict, the repercussions of which still resound throughout contemporary Spain, it pitted Spaniard against Spaniard and brother against brother in a three-year long struggle which would leave Spain with the legacy of a tattered social fabric and a ravaged and impoverished country.[12] Indeed, the fact that Spain has risen almost phoenix-like from the ashes of the Civil War carnage to take her place once more amongst the European family of nations has been one of the great political and social miracles of the latter half of the twentieth century. The Spanish Civil War has been of particular fascination to many due to its international and ideological nature. Seen as a proxy war between the minions of communism and a new world order against the old forces of tradition, religion and capitalism, Spain immediately became the chessboard for an international struggle of conflicting ideologies, a struggle which would evolve into the Second World War and in its final metamorphosis bring the world close to Armageddon in the heady days of the Cold War that have left such an indelible imprint on our recent history.

---

[10] A preliminary version of this article was given as a paper at the 2004 Annual Conference of the Association of Contemporary Iberian Studies (ACIS), that was held at the University of Limerick. Given the dearth of published material on this topic and its academic novelty, the author was encouraged to pursue his research in this area and he is very grateful to the colleagues at the conference who gave this encouragement and many helpful suggestions which shaped the direction of this article. He would also like to extend this gratitude to ACIS for allowing the work to be presented for the first time in a public arena.

[11] See for example Preston, P. *The Coming of the Spanish Civil War*. London: Macmillan, 1978 or the excellent new re-issue of the seminal Brenan, G. *The Spanish Labyrinth*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990.

[12] There are many comprehensive studies of the Spanish Civil War. Amongst the best and most complete are Jackson, G. *A Concise History of the Spanish Civil War*. New York: John Day, 1974 and Thomas, H. *The Spanish Civil War*. New York: Eyre and Spottiswoode, 1961 or the recent publication in Spanish, Vilar, P. *La Guerra Civil Española*. Barcelona: Ed. Crítica, 1999.

As such, we often tend to see the Spanish Civil War in monochrome terms, black versus white; *vencedores* contra *vencidos*; right versus wrong. However, when the war is taken outside an exclusively Spanish setting, these divisions do become somewhat blurred and the Irish experience in Civil War Spain is one example where one sees at times a highly paradoxical but clearly identifiable crossover in ideological make-up between some members of O'Duffy's Irish Brigade who fought for Franco and the International Brigades who fought against him.[13]

However, the Spanish Civil War in Equatorial Guinea presents us with a further novel perspective on the conflict and while the aim of this article is by no means to demean the importance of the great ideological battles that were being fought on Spanish battlefields, it does present a new and interesting dimension to the conflict that surely merits further study. As aforementioned, the background to and course of, the Spanish Civil War in Equatorial Guinea is an academic subject that has been hitherto neglected although quite an amount of archival material does exist in the Ministry for Foreign Affairs and Army Archives in Spain and I am indebted to them for their assistance along with the Embassy of Guinea Ecuatorial in Spain, the Casa de Africa in Madrid and various academic institutions in Equatorial Guinea itself, notably the National University of Equatorial Guinea (UNGE) and the Centro Cultural Hispano-Guineano.[14]

Equatorial Guinea is probably the least well known Spanish-speaking country in the world.[15] Situated on the west coast of Africa and encircled by the Francophone Cameroons and Gabon, it is composed of a coastal region, where the city of Bata is located and five offshore

---

[13]See Keene, J. *Fighting for Franco*. London: Leicester University Press, 2001 for a good account of foreign involvement in the Nationalist ranks. For an account of foreign participation in the defence of the Spanish Republic, two good sources are Castells, A. *Las brigadas internacionales de la guerra de España*. Barcelona: Ed. Ariel, 1974 and the older Brome, V. *The International Brigades, Spain 1936-1939*. London: Heinemann, 1965.

[14]Academic research on Equatorial Guinea in the above institutions is hampered by the strained and unpredictable relationship which exists between Spain and Teodoro Obiang's Equatorial Guinean regime. The fact that the leader of opposition to Obiang, Severo Moto, still lives in exile in Spain is an obvious obstacle to any improvement in the relationship and in Malabo, Spain is continuously identified with efforts to destabilize and topple Obiang's regime.

[15]Unlike another often forgotten colonial outpost, the Philippines, Equatorial Guinea does not even have a centre of the Instituto Cervantes, the cultural wing of the Spanish government. The only former colony that is vying with it for most isolated status in the spanish-speaking world may be the disputed territory of Western Sahara (the former Sahara Española).

islands with the administrative capital, Malabo, being situated on the largest, Bioko. Its population of almost 600,000 is even by African standards, quite young and unlike many of its neighbours, there has been little emigration in the contemporary period. On the contrary and mainly due to the discovery of oil, there has been, in recent years, a growing increase in economic migration to Equatorial Guinea from poorer neighbouring states such as Ghana and Benin.

It was in 1471, twenty years before Columbus reached America, that two Portuguese sailors, Fernao do Poo y Lopes Goncalves first set foot on the mainland of Equatorial Guinea and its offshore islands, the largest of which would bear in time the name of the former. At this time, the main interests of these European navigators was discovery of new territories and, as such, conquest and exploitation would come later. Therefore, the Portuguese left Equatorial Guinea alone until the beginning of the sixteenth century when, inspired by the proposals of Fray Bartolomé de las Casas in Chiapas (Mexico), the slave trade began in earnest and from the Gulf of Guinea, thousands of natives were captured and transported to the new Portuguese and Spanish territories in America.

No attempt was made to colonize the country until 1778 when Spain and Portugal signed the Treaty of El Prado after intense negotiations led by the Conde de Floridablanca, Carlos III's prime minister. This treaty in effect gave Equatorial Guinea to Spain in return for a Spanish withdrawal from Portuguese territory that had been seized in Brazil.[16] However, Spanish colonization was not at first very successful with a mutiny during Joaquin Primo de Rivera's expedition in 1780 and real control of the colony continued to remain in the hands of the Portuguese slave-traders up until the mid-nineteenth century. During this period, British interests also enjoyed a growing sphere of influence in the colony with the foundation of Clarence City, present-day Malabo, in 1827 and an influx of Methodist missionaries.[17] However, British interest in the colony was quite benign and of a predominantly economic nature but in response to the expansion of British influence and growing German interests in the region, Spain did return in strength to the colony with Carlos Chacón being named first Governor-General in 1858 after leading a Spanish expeditionary force back to the colony.

---

[16]By virtue of this treaty, Spain returned to Portugal the disputed territories of Santa Catalina and Río Grande in the south of Brazil.

[17]Foremost amongst these early British colonists were Commodore Bullen who first took Fernando Poo and Captain William Fitz Owen who established a permanent colonial settlement on the island and founded the city of Clarence in honour of the Duke of Clarence, William IV. Spanish colonists would later re-christen the city Santa Isabel and, today, it is known as Malabo, the capital of modern Equatorial Guinea.

During the second half of the nineteenth century, the colonial struggle for territory in Africa continued and a weakened Spain lost considerable swathes of the Gulf of Guinea to France and Germany with the tacit approval of the interminable Paris Conference that was dividing up Africa at the time amongst the colonial powers. Coinciding with the crisis of '98, these losses were a grave affront to Spanish pride and in a direct response, the recently named Marquis of Muni and Governor General, Pedro Jover Tovar, lamenting that the Conference of Paris had been "*un verdadero despojo a un pais desmoralizado*"[18] and how Spain "*ha salido del Continente negro del modo mas cursi posible*",[19] committed suicide aboard the ship "Rabat", which was taking him back to Spain.[20]
However, Spanish involvement in Equatorial Guinea was far from over and in many ways, Equatorial Guinea would, after 1898, increasingly help to feed Spain's imperial ambitions and compensate for its colonial losses in South America and the Philippines. Black Cubans were brought from the lost territories in America to populate Spain's African colony and missionaries began to set up permanent outposts. In 1907 Río Muni was divided up into six administrative areas with the island of Fernando Poo divided into four. Exploitation of the colony's natural resources and, in particular, its forests began, along with the cultivation of cacao with the simultaneous creation of a *Guardia Colonial* in order to protect the colonists.

The arrival in power of Miguel Primo de Rivera in 1923 after a military coup hastened the initiation of a recruitment drive to strengthen the Spanish Army that was embroiled in a bitter colonial war in Morocco.[21] A fundamental part of this initiative was the encouragement of the recruitment of colonial subjects and the colonial question returned to the centre of the Spanish political agenda. In order to facilitate the recruitment of colonial subjects and increase control over

---

[18]Comments attributed to Jose María de Areilza y Fernando María Castiella, both writers and politicians in Franco's Spain. The comment roughly translates as " the pillaging of the colonies of a demoralized country".

[19]Statement attributed to the chief Spanish negotiator, León y Castillo who was also the Spanish ambassador to France at the time. It translates as, "Spain had left the dark continent in the shabbiest way possible".

[20]See Bolekia Boleká, J. *"Panorama de la literatura en español en Guinea Ecuatorial." El Español en el Mundo; Anuario del Instituto Cervantes*, 2005. Barcelona: Círculo de Lectores, 2005. pp. 100-102.

[21]For a good contemporary account of the Moroccan Wars and their impact on contemporary Spain, see Harris, W. *France, Spain and the Rif*. London: Edward Arnold, 1927 or for an in-depth analysis, the much more recent Balfour, S. *Deadly Embrace; Morocco and the Road to the Spanish Civil War*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2002.

Spain's remaining colonies, a series of controversial laws were passed during Primo de Rivera's regime which determined the legal status, entitlements and obligations of natives and colonists. The enforcement of these laws came under the aegis of the newly created *Patronato de Indígenas* in 1928 and when Alfonso XIII went into exile and the first Spanish Republic was declared on April 14th, 1931, there was great hope amongst some of the native population that certain laws might be repealed or that a new body would be set up that would serve better the interests of the native population.

However, the Republican government in Spain, which quickly embarked on a policy of granting greater autonomy to constituent parts of the Republic such as Cataluña and the Basque provinces, did not extend this campaign to Fernando Poo and Río Muni and during the lifetime of the Second Republic, colonial rule was actually strengthened and the territory "pacified" in the offical parlance.[22]

From May, 1931 onwards, there was a growing Spanish interest in the economic potential of Equatorial Guinea and under the supervision of successive governor-generals, namely Sostoa, Lemua and Manzaneque, the colony was turned into a giant factory with the native population working between twelve to fourteen hours daily in the large cacao plantations or lumberyards. The arrival of the Republic diluted the importance of the role of Claretian missionaries who had offered one of the few possibilities of social advancement for the native population[23] and by the time Alcalá Zamora's personal confidante, Sánchez Guerra was installed as Governor-General in 1935, the native population was in a worse position than ever with laws forcing them to purchase their food and other products from their plantation masters in what amounted to little more than legalized slavery. The heady days of the Popular Front government in Spain in the first half of 1936 had aroused great

---

[22]For a good study of the Second Republic in Spain, see Robinson, R. *The Origins of Franco's Spain; The Right, the Republic and Revolution, 1931-1936.* Newton Abbot: David and Charles, 1970 or the long Arrarás, J. *Historia de la segunda República española (4 vols.).* Madrid: Ed. Nacional, 1970.

[23]The Claretians have been one of the most important religious orders in the trajectory of the modern history of Equatorial Guinea both up to and after independence in 1968. The current leader, Teodoro Obiang, was educated by the Claretians and the continuing influence of this religious education can be seen in his private audience and meeting with Pope Benedict XVI in December, 2005. The first Spanish missionaries to arrive in Fernando Poo had been Jesuits but due to external problems in Spain, they were expelled in 1872. A good account of the early role of religion in the colony is contained in Castro Antolín, M. L. *"Organización de la Guinea Española en la segunda mitad del siglo XIX". Estudios Africanos,* 27-28 (2001), Asociación Española de Africanistas, Madrid, pp. 57-103.

expectations amongst the native population and their leaders and there were rumours that a "model colony" might be established under French influence but such rumours never became a reality. Laws were put in force which prohibited the sale of alcoholic drinks to natives, their purchase of property and most importantly, the native population still lacked any legal status or rights as Spanish citizens upon the outbreak of hostilities in Spain in July, 1936 and the onset of the Spanish Civil War.

At the outbreak of the Civil War, there was only one political party in Equatorial Guinea, the *Frente Popular* with only about 150 members and, as could be expected, it was a much diluted version of the peninsular *Frente Popular*. Ideologically, it was much closer to social democracy than communism and it was dominated by a group of middle-class intellectuals who were an integral part of the colony's elite. However, as the events of July, 1936 began to unfold and news of Calvo Sotelo's assassination reached the colony on July 14th, 1936,[24] several political meetings were organized and there were various incidents between groups of *"laicos"*[25] from the Frente Popular and *"clericales"*[26] clustered around the landowners of the Casino.

As bank accounts were frozen in the colony and shipments failed to arrive from Spain, the political temperature rose throughout the summer until the 19th of September when Lt. Col. Serrano, the chief of the *Guardia Colonial* organized a uprising on Fernando Poo against Sánchez Guerra, the Republican Governor-General and following the instructions of Franco's government in Burgos, he assumed the role of Governor-General himself and declared a state of war with the immediate imposition of martial law.

The Civil War had now begun on the colony and Miguel Hernández Porcel, the Vice-Governor based on the mainland in Bata and himself a member of the *Frente Popular*, refused to recognize the authority of Serrano and the territories were henceforth cut off from each other. As a consequence, Francoist supporters or *"clericales"* on the mainland organized a march on Bata on September 23rd, 1936 that aimed to force Hernández Porcel to recognize the authority of Serrano

---

[24]The assassination on July 13th, 1936 of the Nationalist leader, José Calvo Sotelo by Republican sympathizers (in revenge for the murder of José Castillo by Falangists a day earlier) is often seen as the spark that ignited the already planned July 17th uprising of General Franco and his co-conspirators and the outbreak of Civil War the next day.

[25]Literally meaning "lay people", it was attributed to Republican supporters who were, in the majority, anti-clerical.

[26]Literally meaning "clerical supporters", it was attributed in Equatorial Guinea especially to supporters of the Nationalist rebels in Spain who enjoyed the firm backing of the Catholic Church.

and support the military rebellion in Spain. Hernández Porcel despatched a force to stop the marchers from reaching Bata and it is noteworthy that when both groups met, they were of course led by white officers with their battalions made up entirely of native, black soldiers. As the groups met at Comandachina, near the River Ekuku, the first group shouted "*Alto en nombre de la Republica*"[27] which was met by the other group's cry of "*Viva el Ejercito, Arriba Espana*".[28] A short battle ensued with the Republican pro-government force emerging victorious but with two native soldiers killed in combat. On the orders of Hernández Porcel, the ringleaders of the "clericales" were then expelled from Bata with most arriving in Gabon from where many travelled to Fernando Poo, which was now a nationalist stronghold.

On the other side, the coastal region of Río Muni and in particular, its capital Bata became a Republican stronghold with leaders such as José Sierra Companys, a cousin of the leader of the Catalan Generalitat and Miguel Pozanco dominating the political scene. However, as the war progressed in Spain, the isolation of Río Muni combined with Republican losses in the peninsula rendered the territory's situation extremely difficult as there was only one ship at the Republic's disposal and communication with Spain was now almost impossible. This ship was the ironically named *Fernando Poo* which was converted in 1936 into a prison for missionary priests and nuns along with other clerical conspirators.

When the Nationalist ship, the *Ciudad de Mahón*, arrived at Fernando Poo in October, 1936, it was quickly requisitioned by Serrano and the Nationalists who used it to shell Bata and the aforementioned prison ship, the *Fernando Poo*. Many of the prisoners died on board during the shelling and after an expedition of Moorish nationalists soldiers disembarked in Bata, most of the remaining Republicans fled into the interior from where they reached the Gabonese border. Those that remained were deported to the Canary Islands in November, 1936.

As would be expected, the sector of the population that suffered most from this struggle was the native population who had been caught in the crossfire between both sides and who had endured great privation as the colony experienced a shortage of medical supplies, etc.[29]

The defeat of the Republic was not looked on with great regret on

---

[27]Translates as "Halt in the name of the Republic", a popular cry which would be heard throughout the Spanish Civil War.

[28]Translates as "Long Live the Army. Up Nationalist Spain". *Arriba España* was the rallying cry of the Nationalist rebel forces and it still has powerful connotations for right-wing groups in contemporary Spain.

[29]For a good account of Equatorial Guinean social history, see the aforementioned Liniger-Goumaz, M. *Brève Histoire de la Guinée Équatoriale*. Paris: L'Harmattan, 1988.

the part of most of the native population and their tribal leaders and their hopes now rested on the colonial policy of the Spanish nationalists that would not bring them closer to self-determination or independence but would establish almost immediately a stronger and less tenuous link between the native population and the Spanish metropolis. The first step in this policy was the immediate renaming and granting of legal staus to the native districts so by 1937, Kogo had become Puerto Iradier, Niefang, Sevilla and Bimbiles, Valladolid.[30]

In fact, the Nationalists, in stark comparison with the *Frente Popular*, had definite plans for Fernando Poo and Río Muni and even with the outcome of the Civil War not decided in August, 1938, a decree was passed by the Nationalist government in Burgos that for the first time legally unified Fernando Poo and Río Muni as an integral part of Spanish territory. More importantly for the native population, the Statute of the *Patronato de Indígenas* was reformed on September 29th, 1938 with as its expressed aim the *"emancipación"* or possible accession to Spanish citizenship of the native population and the building of schools, hospitals, orphanages and leper colonies to improve the plight of the native population.

The emancipation process was undoubtedly the most important and it was not instituted in full until a decree of September 30th, 1944, that set the conditions for the classification of the natives in two categories, *"emancipados"* y *"no-emancipados"*. Within the *"emancipados"*, there was a further sub-division into those who were fully emancipated and those who were only partially so.[31] Full emancipation would lead to a native having Spanish citizenship and practically all the same legal rights and obligations as a peninsular Spaniard. Importantly, his wife and children would also enjoy the same rights. The only exception was the ban on mixed marriages but this also existed for white Spaniards. However, white Spaniards could have natives as *"concubinas, queridas o amigas ocasionales"*.[32]

For a native to be emancipated, he had to be twenty-one years old, have the necessary maturity to be an adult in the metropolis, possess a

---

[30]A similar policy of hispancization was introduced by the Francoist regime in the Moroccan colonies after the Nationalist victory in the Spanish Civil War.

[31]For accounts of this period, see Sáez de Gevantes, L. *El africanismo español*. Madrid: CSIC, 1963, Díaz Pinés, O. *Los territorios españoles del Golfo de Guinea*. Madrid: Publicaciones Españolas, 1952. The regime-financed CSIC (Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas) also produced throughout the 1950's and 1960's a range of reports on Equatorial Guinea dealing with specific areas of native development in the colony such as education and health.

[32]See the Francoist Decree of September 30th, 1944 concerning the civil rights and obligations of the native and colonial population of Equatorial Guinea.

professional or academic qualification from a secondary school and he had to have been employed for two years in a Spanish concern. On the other hand, it was also possible to be emancipated for those in the service of the Spanish state with a rank not less than indigenous auxiliary.

As aforementioned, emancipation brought to the natives Spanish citizenship rights, etc. but on a practical level, it permitted them to act as witnesses in court, receive loans to the value of 10,000 pesetas, buy and consume olive oil, buy and consume wheat bread and to drink alcohol in public and in the same establishments as white Europeans. Partially emancipated natives enjoyed most of the these benefits also but were not allowed to buy or consume alcohol.

Of course, a whole new legal system and code had to be introduced to give a legal character to these changes and its composition was based on a framework that allowed appeal in the first instance to Territorial High Court in Madrid and in the final instance to the Supreme Court in Madrid.

Such changes may seem today to be nothing more than a system of watered-down apartheid and it is clear from archival material that political, economic and cultural hegemony continued to lie in the hands of the Spanish colonists. However, although it would be an exaggeration to call Francoist colonial policy enlightened, it did offer an initial chink of light for the native population as for the first time, they now enjoyed a legal status and could buy and sell property, etc. Paradoxically, this of course led to the seeds of nationalism being sown and in this first generation of "*emancipados*" we find the fathers of Equatorial Guinean independence such as Enrique Nvó, Acacio Mañé. Bonifacio Ondó and of course, Francisco Macías. Indeed, Macías would be the first elected President of Equatorial Guinea when it finally achieved independence in October 12th, 1968.

In conclusion, from a native point of view, one could state that the Spanish Civil War had little real ideological resonance in Equatorial Guinea as under the Second Republic and *Frente Popular* as under the Francoist regime, there still existed a clear division of masters and servants. However, the Francoist regime did have a definite colonial policy albeit one based on an idea of benevolent racial superiority and one must comment upon the absence of any type of policy of native advancement on the part of the Second Republic. On a practical level, it was the native population which suffered the privations and casualties of the Civil War as both sides forcefully recruited them into their respective factions as their foot-soldiers and the food shortages affected primarily the native population and in particular, native children.

That said, it is possible that a progressive colonial policy could have been followed by a *Frente Popular* government if it had had the opportunity but the 1936 military uprising prevented this government from

embarking on any long-term programme. However, it is pertinent to point out that the situation of Equatorial Guinea, outside its economic benefits to Spain, was not mentioned in any *Frente Popular* manifestos, etc. and the Second Republic, which was so active on the question of granting autonomy to the historic nationalities in Spain, was inactive during its life on the question of native rights and the development of the colonies.

The unfortunate legacy of this reality is the distrust in Equatorial Guinea for left-wing movements and the terrible relationship between the Socialist Government of Felipe González from 1982 to 1996 and the regime of Teodoro Obiang in Equatorial Guinea is testament to this.[33] Amongst many ordinary Equatorial Guineans, there is a marked nostalgia for a strong leader like Franco as with any right-wing authoritarian regime, they identify individuals and figures with the improvement of their lot. It is this nostalgia and distaste in many ways for the democracy of the Second Republic which brought Obiang to power in 1979 and has maintained him there since, despite repeated opposition attempts to overthrow him, many with foreign help.[34] Many of these attempts have foundered due to the lack of mass opposition or real interest in establishing democracy and, in this way, although the last shells were fired in the Bay of Bata over sixty-five years ago, one could well argue that the Spanish Civil War and its legacy is still alive and well in Equatorial Guinea today.

University of Limerick

---

[33]See the aforementioned Liniger-Goumaz, M. *Brève Histoire de la Guinée Équatoriale*. Paris: L'Harmattan, 1988. The problematic relationship between Spain and her former colony is also amply covered by the Spanish press and in particular by the daily, *El País*. Spain still remains home to many political exiles from Equatorial Guinea.

[34]Indeed, Teodoro Obiang has been one of the longest-serving dictators in Africa and despite allegedly suffering from advanced prostate cancer and being in extreme ill health, he continues to maintain a resilient and tight grip on power. His cult of personality is paramount in a country where in July, 2003, state radio officially declared him a "God" and where many Equatorial Guineans sport a daily uniform of a t-shirt with a photo of the president for life emblazoned across it. Perhaps eerily echoing his mentor in Francoist Spain, Obiang's photograph is omnipresent throughout the country and it is rare to find any location or gathering without a picture of Obiang present.

Mary S. Vásquez

THE POETICS OF LOSS IN ANTONIO MUÑOZ MOLINA'S "¡OH TÚ QUE LO SABÍAS" / "OH YOU, WHO KNEW SO WELL," from *Sefarad*

> España es un sitio casi inexistente de tan remoto, un país inaccesible, desconocido, ingrato, llamado Sefarad, añorado con una melancolía sin fundamento ni disculpa, con una lealtad tan asidua como la que se fueron pasando de padres a hijos los antecesores del señor Isaac Salama, el único de todo su linaje que cumplió el sueño heredado del regreso para ser expulsado otra vez y ya definitivamente, por culpa de un infortunio....
>
> (Spain is so remote that it is nearly nonexistent, an inaccessible, unknown, thankless country they called Sepharad, longing for it with a melancholy without basis or excuse, with a loyalty as constant as that passed from father to son by the ancestors of Señor Salama, the only one of his line to fulfill the hereditary dream of return, only to be expelled once again, and this time definitively, because of a misfortune....)
>
> Antonio Muñoz Molina
> "Oh tú que lo sabías," *Sefarad*

Sefarad (2001) by the Ubeda (Jaén) writer Antonio Muñoz Molina, who is now director of the Instituto Cervantes in New York City, is a collection of seventeen tales variously woven from themes of banishment, truncation, sexual transgression, epiphany, war, and betrayal. The segments range from thirteen to 51 pages in length. Muñoz Molina's text is a hybrid literary form: narrative fiction and essay. It is a hybridity that has gained currency among contemporary writers of serious Peninsular fiction. Javier Cercas's *Soldados de Salamina* is one highly successful example. However, this particular hybridity is hardly new to Spanish letters, having been practised by such past canonical writers as the Enlightenment's José Cadalso y Vázquez in his *Cartas marruecas* and by the Romantic Mariano José de Larra in his *Artículos de costumbres*. The hybrid form permits the use of historical material in open subjectivity, in contrast with those often more covert subjectivities of the journalist or the historian. Through recontextualisation, play with perspective and sequence, and the confluence of historical and fictional events, this hybrid mode can recast history in illuminating ways. It also offers a rich field of ambiguity upon which fact and fiction, memory

and invention, engage one another in play and in battle, contenders for readerly adherence. Narratorial stance is mutable, shifting, both contributing to and mirroring the hybridity of other textual strategies.

Sefarad is such a text. It is constructed from a second ambiguity, one named in the book's subtitle, *Una novela de novelas*. Muñoz Molina's stories create settings and evoke phenomena associated with the Soviet Union, Nazi Germany, and Nazi appropriation of surrounding nations, Spanish Republican exile and the Republican familial experience in Francoist Spain, the modern metropolis and its rudderless souls, the gradual death of a small Spanish town, and, in three or possibly four of the work's segments, the Sephardic diaspora. Each of the tales of *Sefarad* can stand alone. Yet the stories enter into tacit dialogue with one another, the parallels between character experience of Communist and Fascist totalitarian states constituting an especially rich textual exchange. Historical personages recur before and after the stories centring upon them: Kafka's mistress Milena Jesenka; the German Willie Münzenberg; Hans Mayer alias Jean Améry; Greta Buber-Neumann and her husband, Heinz Neumann, both victims of the Soviet purges. Fictional characters make their own reappearances, perhaps most notably the now-mad figure always seen wearing a green-feathered Tyrolean hat. Furthermore, each of Muñoz Molina's narrative segments moves around an axis of loss. It is sometimes sudden, cataclysmic; in other instances stealthy and slow; in still others it is disguised as normality, simply the way things are. The portrayal of loss is cumulative, its accretions conferring unity. *Sefarad* is, then, as the sum of its parts, both novel and compendium of stories.

I will focus in these pages upon the representation of loss, what I term the poetics of loss, in one of the tales of *Sefarad*, "Oh tú que lo sabías," "Oh You, Who Knew So Well." Quotations from the text to be used in the analysis will be offered first in Muñoz Molina's original Spanish, then parenthetically in English using Margaret Sayers Peden's 2003 translation, from *Sepharad*.

At 43 pages one of the longest of the stories comprising *Sefarad*, the tale is set in North Africa, in Tangiers, where the focaliser and unnamed primary narrator, who is vaguely identified in the tale as a writer, has probably been invited to speak at the Ateneo Español, the Spanish cultural centre. Presiding over that much-debilitated entity is Isaac Salama, the tale's other narrator, a Hungarian Jew, son of Sephardic parents, or at least a Sephardic father. He is the lone, and deeply lonely, survivor, he and his father having escaped from Hungary with Spanish passports, issued in accordance with the Spanish law of 1924 that restored Spanish citizenship to the descendants of the Sephardim. Their flight follows the seizure and disappearance of Isaac's mother and sisters at the hands of the hated Hungarian fascists. Isaac has told the family's story to his visitor. His father had opened a textile business in Tangiers

like the one he had owned in Budapest. Isaac, yearning for escape, had studied, and brilliantly, at university in Spain, then returned to the peninsula with plans to stay. An auto accident on a twisting night road in southern Spain crippled him for life. The new car had been a gift from his father.

Howard Sachar, author of the 2005 *A History of the Jews in the Modern World*, details in his earlier *Farewell España: The World of the Sephardim Remembered* (1994) the complex history of affirmation and negation that characterized down through the centuries the Sephardic presence in present-day Morocco. The Salama father in Muñoz Molina's text acts out during the long Tangiers years a tangled story of his own in a coupling of renunciation and embrace. On the one hand, he insists on carrying on with his son a complete severing from the Hungarian tongue. "...[M]i padre se empeñó en que no volviéramos a hablarla, ni siquiera entre nosotros, entre él y yo, los únicos que habíamos quedado de toda nuestra familia..." (*Sefarad* 167). ([M]y father insisted on never speaking it again, not even between the two of us, the only ones left of our entire family..." [*Sepharad* 110].) Yet to his new textile business he gave the name Galerías Duna, the Hungarian name for the River Danube paired with the Spanish word; his business in Budapest had borne exactly the same name. The father had been a deep admirer of continental culture, yet he now turned his back upon the Europe that had betrayed the family, "...Europa, adonde mi padre ya no quiso nunca volver, la Europa que él había amado sobre todas las cosas y de la que se había enorgullecido..." (*Sepharad* 167) ("...Europe, which my father never wanted to return to, the Europe he had loved above all else and of which he had been so proud...[*Sepharad* 110]). The Salamas now carried "nuestra nueva identidad española" (*Sefarad* 167) ("the new Spanish identity" [*Sepharad* 110]), thanks to which they had escaped, yet ambivalence enters anew. Despite his reverence for his part of Europe, the father raised his children with a sense of their Spanish heritage. "Sefarad era nombre de nuestra patria verdadera aunque nos hubieran expulsado de ella hacía más de cuatro siglos" (*Sefarad* 167) ("Sepharad was the name of our true homeland, although we'd been expelled from it more than four centuries ago" [*Sepharad* 110]), though the elder Salama's knowledge of *ladino* was limited to a lullaby or two. The family was Jewish, yet its members never went to synagogue, and the father knew only a few words in Hebrew. When he rejected Europe, it was "...para convertirse en algo que tampoco era, un judío celoso de la Ley y aislado y huraño entre los gentiles..." (*Sefarad* 167), ("...in order to turn himself into a zealous Orthodox Jew, isolated and reticent among Gentiles..." [*Sepharad* 110]).[1] When tensions rose in Morocco,

[1]The Peden translation of this quotation sacrifices an important point of identity and its stubborn multiplicity and elusiveness, no doubt for the sake of flu-

the father saw another expulsion coming.

> Sólo espero que nos echen con mejores modales que los húngaros, o que los españoles en 1492.
>
> Dijo eso, los españoles, como si no se considerase ya uno de ellos...." (*Sefarad* 170)
>
> ("I only hope they throw us out with better manners than the Hungarians, or the Spanish in 1492.
>
> That's what he said, *the Spanish*, as if he didn't consider himself one of them anymore..." [*Sepharad* 112])

Where, then, was home? The father's two points of identity had been Spain, the family's legendary home, and Hungary/Europe. Both he simultaneously affirmed and repudiated. He came to inhabit no terrain save that last place of failure and loss, the irrevocable, irremediable sacrifice of his loved ones to the Nazi terror in Hungary. His son, too, dwells in his own moment and place of loss, on a train where he met a young woman. On that train, moveable sphere of possibilities, Isaac Salama had, and relinquished, what might, or might not, have been. While his father inhabits a moment of known, cataclysmic loss of nearly all that he knew and cherished, Isaac resides in a moment of ambiguity, kept alive through the years. The father's loss is rendered in silence, the son's in story.

In his rendering of Isaac's tale, Muñoz Molina respects the conventions of the train narrative and prepares the terrain well for readerly reception of Isaac Salama's memory of encounter and loss on a train out of Tangiers. Following Salama's first sonorous recitation to his listener, Muñoz Molina's primary narrator, of the Baudelaire sonnet "À une passante," he seems about to speak. Muñoz Molina causes the scene to be interrupted; the concert at the Ateneo Español is about to begin. There is in this deferral a kind of textual seduction of the reader, a postponement of textual desire, a desire that will be rewarded, as its subject's own desire both is and is not, for he cherishes, in a sense, his (perhaps needed) defeat. Muñoz Molina has his narrator return to the evocation of the Baudelarian sonnet and its importance to Salama only in the concluding passages of "Oh tú que lo sabías" / "Oh You, Who Knew So Well," and it is now that he relates Salama's deferred tale

First, however, Muñoz Molina has recourse to a distancing stratagem. In the easy jocularity of talk among writers travelling by train to a conference in Asturias, someone's mention of Isaac Salama elicits a

---

idity, in rendering "para convertirse en algo que tampoco era" as "in order to turn himself into a zealous Orthodox Jew...." In the son's view, his father has turned himself from one thing that he was not into something else that he was not, either.

lengthy, colloquial, and mocking evocation of him by one of the authors. Disparaged by this speaker are Salama's old and formal Spanish, the pittance that he as director of the Ateneo Español in Tangiers has been able to offer the visiting speaker, Salama's close attention to his guest and continual accompaniment of him, a hospitality that, come as it may have with the baggage of complaint about conditions in Tangiers, is certainly genuine. The obvious insensitivity in this speaker's burlesque undercuts the validity of his mockery and turns it textually back upon him. Muñoz Molina's narrator thus simultaneously removes himself from any melodrama in the story he will now relate and privileges that very story. This train tale is the concluding portion of the narrative segment of *Sefarad* entitled "Oh tú que lo sabías" / "Oh You, Who Knew So Well." The segment's last line echoes this title and is also the closing line of Baudelaire's sonnet.

While on a business trip, Isaac is enthralled by a lovely young woman who shares his compartment. He, in turn, apparently enthrals her. Keeping his coat tightly around his shrivelled legs and his crutches on the rack above his seat, he does not rise when she leaves, lest she learn of his disability, and lets her go. The train is a mobile world of transitory self-invention, a self-enclosed world but not a permanent one. Here, the destination is not a reincorporation or marker of a new beginning but a rupture, a loss. His coat covers his damaging secret, his shrivelled legs, his self-defined unlovable self, as his charming words, his unaccustomed verbal brilliance, convey a worthier self. His crippled state functions textually as a metaphor for his view of his Jewishmess, his coat as his denial of it. (Salama, recalling his flight to Spain, admits that "Se lo digo y me da vergüenza: lo que yo quería era no ser judío" [*Sefarad* 173], "'I say it now, to my shame: what I wanted was not to be a Jew'" [*Sepharad* 114].) Motion was his earlier expression of his escape—the boat to Spain, then his high-speed ride in the new car. That flight failed. Now motion, the journey by train, again invites escape from his prison house, through self-reinvention, not by external trappings but by the word. He ends it by inaction, by his assumption that all is a fiction. He will then insert himself into Baudelaire's poetic text, becoming the poetic speaker, appropriating that speaker's loss as his own. That poem moves around an axis of joined opposites: aperture and closure, life and death. Isaac takes on the closure, while extratextually, outside the Baudelarian text and integrally to the Muñoz Molina one, the tension between the poles is left intact. Might the young woman have sensed more than he knew? Their knees did, after all, touch and were pressed together by a lurch in the train. Was she perhaps more capable than he of seeing beyond physical limitations? Might she have carried her own burden of a different order, been engaged in her own flight, devised her own cover?

Isaac's self-reinvention on the train replicates his own earlier one, as a student in Spain, where he could almost be what he longed to become. "...[P]odía dejarse llevar hacia una existencia más o menos idéntica a la de los demás, sus compatriotas, sus compañeros de curso, los amigos que no le preguntaban a uno por su origen..." (*Sefarad* 157). ("...[Y]ou could let yourself be borne off to a life more or less like that other people lived, his compatriots, classmates, and the friends who never asked about his past... [*Sepharad* 103].) Yet their not asking about what night be more faithfully rendered here as his origins is not quite the same as his being one of them, which, with his Spanish passport, he both is and is not. One is reminded of Isaac's assessment of his father's reinvention of self as "algo que tampoco era" (167), something that he was not, either. The beautiful young woman on the train becomes a metaphor for the Spain of ancestral and personal longing even as what he possessed and lost there moves in confluence with the love he may have met and lost on the train. The dual metaphorical movement is circular, like the family's own diaspora, like the boat carrying passengers between Tangiers and Algeciras, the sound of whose horn echoes Isaac's exaltation at his initial escape to Spain, sounding again in the distance, a reminder of defeat, as Isaac and the primary narrator talk amid the disarray of the Ateneo office.

Both metaphors are laden with ambiguity. The ancestral love for Spain is a bitter one, though no less intense and abiding for it; it is the *amor amargo*, though at a diasporic distance, that has expressed itself through centuries of Spanish literature and culture. Whereas the family's, and Sephardim's, expulsions were engendered from without, Isaac's own losses—of Spain and of his potential love—came out of choices of his own. With the years, Isaac had come to see the car accident as "...consecuencia y castigo de su propia soberbia, de la culpable desmesura que le había empujado a avergonzarse de su padre y a renegar de él en lo más hondo de su corazón" (*Sefarad* 169) ("...a consequence and punishment for his own pride, for the self-indulgence that had pushed him to be ashamed of his father and to reject him in his deepest heart" [*Sepharad* 111-112]). As for the young woman, Isaac, to whom she had given her Casablanca address, elected, through permanent inaction, to resolve ambiguity into loss.

There may be in Muñoz Molina's choice of this site a parodic echo of the canonical film of sacrificed love bearing that city's name as its title. The 1942 film "Casablanca" stands at an ironic distance from the conventions of the representation of classic lost love, as it does from those of the "bad boy" / angelic woman romance. Rick is hardly a hero for "giving up" another man's wife, and the wife of a hero of the Resistance at that. Nor is Ilsa the virtuous wartime wife, willing as she is to choose Rick over Victor Laszlo, desirous even of doing so. In the

film, a beautiful woman and her husband board a plane in Casablanca. In the Isaac Salama story inserted into the Muñoz Molina one, a lovely young woman disembarks from a train in Casablanca. Both the film's Rick and the literary text's Isaac Salama choose loss, one in promotion of a cause beyond himself—victory over fascism—, the other out of fear of repudiation in a woman's eyes. The film, then, exercises parody, and perhaps self-parody, while the Muñoz Molina text may parody the film.

The term parody is employed here in the sense in which Linda Hutcheon develops it in *A Theory of Parody: The Teachings of Twentieth-Century Art Forms* (1985). As Hutcheon posits parody, it need not imply ridicule or diminishment, a reductionist reflection of one text in another. Rather, Hutcheon goes to the second etymological sense of the ancient Greek prefix *para-*, not as "counter" or "against" but as "beside," with *odos* as "song" (Hutcheon 32). Parody is, then, a kind of dialogue between equals, with one text incorporated into another. The author encodes; the knowledgeable reader decodes. Parody is a bi-textual process, a "repetition with difference" (32). It involves a dual act, the motor for which is normally irony, creator of distance. "The structural identity of the text as a parody depends, then, on the coincidence, at the level of strategy, of decoding (recognition and interpretation) and encoding (34).

A parodic exercise, a repetition with difference, is clearly suggested in Muñoz Molina's evocation through his character Isaac Salama of the Baudelaire sonnet "À une passante." He has Salama recite the sonnet—quite literally a song, as in the etymological root of parody— though the reader "hears" only the last line: "O toi que j'eusse aimé [sic]![2] O toi qui le savais!" (Muñoz Molina 176). In the Baudelaire poem, in classic Petrarchan form, the two quatrains set forth the situation, to which the two tercets respond. A noisy street surrounded the poetic speaker. A woman passed, deep in mourning, exhibiting a "douleur majesteuse" (Baudelaire 92). She was "agile et noble" (92), her eyes promising both sweetness and pleasure. The woman in Salama's train story, on the other hand, is vibrant, talkative, in the full plenitude of her enthusiastic youth. In the first tercet of the Baudelarian sonnet, the poetic speaker has felt himself reborn. Yet the renewal is bracketed, enclosed, by its denial; in line one of this tercet, "Un éclair...puis la nuit," a flash, a glow—in Geoffrey Wagner's rendering, "a gleam" (Baudelaire trans. Wagner 83), then the night, and the beauty is fleeting, "fugitive" (Baudelaire 93). The correspondence with the Salama train story is here quite close, though the hint of death in Baudelaire's Romantic coupling of partaking and perishing, as in his image of "le plaisir qui tue" {92), is

---

[2]The Baudelaire text, in the edition of complete works consulted and cited below, reads "aimée."

absent from the Salama tale. The third line of the tercet is a question: "Ne te verai-je plus que dans l'éternité?" (93), the last component of which does not form part of Salama's sense of the matter. The second tercet, after lamenting distance ("loin"), and a perhaps permanent removal in time ("trop tard," "*jamais*" [93]), posits a mutual impossibility of re-encounter: "Car j'ignore où tu fuis, tu ne sais où je vais" (93). Salama's options were greater; the young woman had given him her address, that of the family home and thus presumably permanent, while he had scribbled for her a false address in Tangiers. He could have found her, though she with far less likelihood him. Salama, unlike Baudelaire's poetic speaker, had to choose again and again his loss. The second half of the Baudelarian line, "tu ne sais où je vais," you do not know where I am going, does find its parallel in Salama, though the first half, "Car j'ignore où tu fuis," I do not know where you flee to, could not be his words. Though she disembarks while he remains on the train, it is he who flees. In the concluding sentence of his story, Muñoz Molina introduces a final element of parodic distance from the Baudelaire text:

> Oh tú a quien yo hubiera amado, recitó el señor Isaac Salama aquella tarde en su despacho del Ateneo Español, con la misma grave pesadumbre con que habrá dicho los versículos del kaddish en memoria de su padre, mientras llegaba por la ventana abierta el sonido de la sirena de un barco y la salmodia de un muecín, oh tú que lo sabías. (*Sefarad* 184)
>
> *Oh you, whom I would have loved,* [señor Isaac Salama] recited that evening in his office in the Ateneo Español, moved as deeply as if he were chanting the Kaddish in his father's memory, [while] the sound of a ship's horn and the music of a muezzin's call came through the open window. *Oh you, who knew so well.* (*Sepharad* 122)[3]

"[O]h tú que lo sabías." Both the direct object and the verb resonate beyond Baudelaire. The "lo" or "it" suggests not only Salama's attraction to the young woman but also his disability, of which she was possibly, even likely, aware, and, too, his own inability to act before he lost her. "Pero en el fondo sabe, y no ha dejado de saberlo ni un solo instante, que no se atreverá" (*Sefarad* 183) ("But deep down he knows and has never doubted for an instant that he won't do that" [*Sepharad* 121][4]). The "tú", "you," of the "sabías," "knew," can be both the young woman and Salama himself.

---

[3]Muñoz Molina's "con la misma grave pesadumbre" might well be rendered as "with the same grave sorrow" or "with the same heavy grief."

[4]I would render this sentence as,"But deep down he knows, and he has known it every instant since, that he won't be brave enough to do it."

Muñoz Molina chose for the narrative segment that is "Oh tú que lo sabías" / "Oh You, Who Knew So Well" a form of empathic narration in which free indirect style alternates, often within the same paragraph, with first-person narration, primary narrator becoming narrataire. He creates an affective convergence of his two narrators that lends immediacy and intimacy to his tale. Other devices utilized by Muñoz Molina effect distancing. The parodic functions are joined by the narratorial generation of distance through disqualification of an anonymous speaker's mockery of Salama, both discussed above, and by use of the *Ubi sunt* device. Muñoz Molina has his primary narrator, ask "¿Qué habrá sido de..?", "What can have become of...?", both with respect to the guide who had shown Isaac Salama the site of the small extermination camp where his mother and sisters had died and in reference to Isaac Salama himself (*Sefarad* 145, 150). The stratagem serves to establish both temporal and emotional distance, combatting any possible easy sentimentality.

The senses of intimacy and removal effected in Muñoz Molina's text are the proximity to, and the distance from, Salama's land of inherited memory, his crafted life of freedom as a Spaniard among Spaniards, his Hungarian upbringing, the withered hope on the train. And they are the arresting of both Salamas, father and son, at a point of perpetuated loss. In both men, stasis is paradoxically joined to diaspora, with stasis as entrapment and diaspora as the experience and the textual rendering of loss. Both Salamas have rewritten themselves as multiple texts, becoming what they were not and unable to escape what they were. Stasis and diaspora meet for both men in memory, which both offers continuity and imposes fragmentation. These are the two sides of the insistence of memory: the severing that marked the onset of memorial torment and the unbroken perpetuation of that memory's resonant evocation. Memory offers what they cannot reach and imposes what they cannot escape. For both of these children of banishment, Hungarian Sephardim of linear and circular ancestral traditions and personal journeys, memory is perhaps the only terrain that is truly home.

Davidson College

Works Cited

Baudelaire, Charles. *Selected Poems*. Bilingual edition. Trans. Geoffrey Wagner. London: Falcon Press, 1946.

___. "À une passante." From *Tableaux Parisiens, Les fleurs du mal*, 1861. *Oeuvres Completes*, ed. Claude Pichois. Vol. I. Paris: Gallimard, 1973. 92-93.

"Casablanca," dir. Michael Curtiz. Starring Humphrey Bogart, Ingrid Bergman, and Paul Henreid. MGM Studios, 1942.

Hutcheon, Linda. *A Theory of Parody: The Teachings of Twentieth-Century Art Forms*. New York and London: Methuen, 1985.

Muñoz Molina, Antonio. Sefarad. *Una novela de novelas*. Madrid: Santillana, 2001.

——. Sepharad. Trans. *Margaret Sayers Peden*. Orlando, New York and Toronto: Harper, 2003.

Sachar, Howard M. Farewell España: *The World of the Sephardim Remembered*. New York: Vintage, 1994.

——. *A History of the Jews in the Modern World*. Boston: Knopf, 2005.

Jana Vizmuller-Zocco

THE NAMES OF THE MEDITERRANEAN: A LINGUISTIC AND CULTURAL JOURNEY*

The Mediterranean Sea has been the subject of innumerable studies: biologists explain that it is not as rich in fish as the other seas, climatologists underline the fact that due to its waters, the summer and winter seasons show extremes, historians argue the focal position of the sea as a unifying or dividing force; economists mention the cool wet winters that permit the production of the "trinity of wheat, wine, oil" (Fiume 5), physicists analyze the particles that make up the color of its waters (Aitken 1882), ecologists warn us of rampant pollution, geneticists study the gene pools of the Mediterranean populations (Arnaiz-Villena et al.), and so on. Linguists have as yet to say the final word about the Sea's name and about its role in the diffusion, convergence, innovation, and loss of linguistic features in the 40 or so languages and language varieties spoken around its shores. Historians keep searching for the elusive characteristics of Mediterranean-ness, without, however, taking account of the linguistic aspect of culture. According to R. King, "there is no single criterion which enables one to draw a line on a map which separates the Mediterranean from the non-Mediterranean. Mediterranean identity is a more nebulous, but powerful concept that derives from environmental characteristics, cultural features and, above all, from the spatial interactions between the two. The Mediterranean is a sea, a climate, a landscape, a way of life—all of these and much more" (2). And yet, "attempts to establish precise characteristics for defining what is Mediterranean have undesirable consequences", as Purcell argues (10). Does the same hazy picture obtain when the Mediterranean is analyzed from a linguistic perspective? What follows attempts to take a first step in order to answer this question.

The names of the Mediterranean Sea in the languages of the peoples inhabiting its shores

Barring too fragmented an account, it is assumed here that the waters of the Mediterranean constitute a single entity (following one of the topics of Horden and Purcell 10). Therefore, the discussion presented

*This is a reworked version of a lecture presented to the Canadian Institute for Mediterranean Studies, Toronto chapter, on January 26, 2006.

below does not include a description of the names of specific gulfs, seas, or other internal divisions of the Mediterranean. The division of a sea into further seas is an interesting question (See Burr 1932). For example, the speakers of Slavic languages who go to warm up their bones on the shores of *Jadran;* which is the *Adriatic* to the English-speakers (and *Adriatico* to Italians), but which used to be called the *Gulf of Venice,* the name that appeared on medieval Arab and Renaissance European maps. Other Arabic and Renaissance maps show *Mare Africum* south west of Sicily, a name not present on Italian or English modern maps. Although these taxonomic aspects are not dealt with here, the topic is clearly worthy of attention.

Onomastics, the science of names and naming, has various branches: anthroponymy deals with personal names (first, last, nicknames); toponymy describes the names of geographical features, cities, etc.; hydronymy focuses on the names of bodies of waters; pelagonymy is concerned with the names of seas. Dorion has suggested a possible semantic and linguistic sequence of naming places: Speaker 1 sees a place which is connected in his/her mind to a referent (concept that stands for the place), Speaker 1 names the place according to this abstract referent: i.e., gives it a linguistic form, and then communicates this form, i.e., word, to speaker 2. Speaker 2 must understand that that linguistic form with that particular referent indicates the specific place. Often, the original meaning of the referent fades into oblivion in speakers' minds when the naming conditions and semantic motivation have been forgotten (see also Rutkowski 2001:26). This is supported both by my Hebrew and Finnish informants who expressed great surprise at the fact that the name of the Sea in their languages actually has a meaning, proving thus the theory that in the speaker's mind a name is not denoting anything.

Although the naming process seems logical and semantically transparent, the question remains as to when a name of a place becomes a toponym. In other words, the ancient Egyptians called the Mediterranean Sea the "Sea of the Philistines"—this is clearly a possessive attribute, but is it the name that everyone knew the sea by? Does it refer to the whole sea or just to the area inhabited by that tribe? Also, Homer's allusion to the same body of water, "wine colored sea" has a referent, but this referent is an epithet, it is hardly a place name in the scientific meaning of toponym. One answer to this can be the appearance of the name on maps; cartography should be of help here. Unfortunately, the oldest map of the Western world ever found does not refer to the Mediterranean sea, it does, however, indicate "Taras", i.e. the gulf of Taranto (See http://www.ultimapagina.it/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=355&Itemid=3). On many early maps, the name of the sea is not specified, for example, the 1561 map of

Southern Europe by the official Spanish royal cartographer Diego Holmen does not include a name for the Mediterranean. Secondly, rendering something official by publishing it on a map may not mean that everyone uses this name.

An engagement in onomastic work means fulfilling five requirements as follows:

—locating and consulting all available documentation
—taking into account all the available information
—ensuring that dates tally
—providing a plausible pathway by which the name could have got to where it is attested by the time it is attested
—being prepared to consider alternative accounts (Trask 1996:353).

The most obvious places to look for the names of the Mediterranean are old and newer maps (in all the present and ancient languages of the Mediterranean), ancient literary sources (first and foremost the Hebrew Bible), written monuments of ancient languages, Egyptian inscriptions, ancient Greek and Roman geographies, histories and travel accounts, portulan descriptions, Arabic geographies, histories and maps. As is often the case in history, innumerable sources were lost due to the material used for the visual representation of space, such as clay tablets, parchment, mosaic floors, ceramics, murals, papyrus, etc.

Furthermore, it seemed that ancient Greek, Sicilian, Arabic legends of the sea might convery information regarding etymologies, explanations or indeed names. Unfortunately, this trail was not successful as far as the names of the sea are concerned; it did, however, reaffirm the fact that the sea is a constant looming presence in the legends of the peoples inhabiting its shores. The well-known Greek myths will not be repeated here, suffice it to say that the waters of the "wine-dark sea" were often a negative force of an enemy for Odysseus and the Greek heroes, illustrating thus the inner dread of the Greeks for the sea (Rose 1934:15). There is a suggestion that the mysterious and violent portrayal of some of the sea's particular areas, such as the Scylla and Charybdis (Strait of Messina), was an attempt on the part of the Phoenicians to dissuade the ancient Greeks from encroaching on the Phoenicians' trade routes (Rose 1934:49). One Arab and one Sicilian legend will suffice to illustrate two possible popular views—among many—of the Mediterranean.

God and the Mediterranean – Arabic (Pinna 5; transl. from Italian mine)

It is narrated that God, the day after Creation, turned to the Mediterranean saying that, as it was a part of the newly created world, it would welcome faithful people who would sing praises to God. And God asked the sea: "How do you intend to treat them?". The answer was: "Well, Lord, I will make them drown". So God sent a curse against the waters, which ever since then have been poor in

fish. But the rebellious creature still rises up angry and full of tempests at dawn of each Friday, the sacred day of the Muslims.

This legend underscores the dread the Arabs showed towards the sea and the fear they had of its power, continuing thus the same feelings of the ancient Greeks and Romans.

The legend of Colapesce - Sicilian

This is the legend of Colapesce, a young man living in Messina, whose favourite activity was swimming: he was so good at it, his love of the water and the fish was so great, that his fame reached the emperor Frederick II. The emperor, wishing to test Colapesce's abilities, not once but three times threw a cup into the sea and asked Colapesce to retrieve it. The youth dove and emerged twice, illustrating his great abilities. The third time, however, he did not appear back on land: he saw that Sicily was supported by three columns, two of which were sturdy, but the third one, the one under Messina, cracked, could crumble and make Sicily plunge into the sea. So he stayed there and with his shoulder bears the weight of the island so that it does not disappear into the sea.

The versions of this legend are many; its meanings varied; it shows, however, that the power of the sea is much greater than the solidity of the earth.

The Names of the Mediterranean

In the Hebrew Bible, the sea is simply called "Sea" (*yam* or *hay-yam*) (Joshua 16:8), according to the process whereby a general term is used to indicate a particular geographical feature (a sort of reverse metonymy), much like when we ask today someone who has gone to the city (Toronto) whether they have seen the lake (Ontario); or present days Sicilians call Etna *a muntagna* "the mountain": an instance of a specifying semantic use of a general term, whose referent is taken for granted. The Bible also mentions "Great Sea" (*hay-yam hag-gadol*) (Gardner 1999:412), "Western Sea" (Deuteronomy 11:24) and "Sea of the Philistines" (Exodus 23:31). In Modern Hebrew, *yam tichon* (Middle Ocean) is the preferred name.

Any discussion of the Mediterranean Sea must mention the Sea Peoples, "Warriors of the ancient Mediterranean 1250-1150 BC" (as the subtitle of Sandar's 1985 book explains). History has not been generous with this group of diverse tribes that about 3200 years ago mounted what the Egyptians, in the inscriptions and carvings at Karnak and Luxor, called "the Great Sea and Land Raids". Although their appellation contains reference to a sea, Sanders suggests that "the trouble-makers were not 'a people' and only to a limited extent they were 'of the sea' (p. 10). Egyptian sources, describing the turmoil caused by these "raiders", name the sea "Great". Later documents indicate that the Egyptians used

the possessive attribute "Sea of the Philistines", but it is not clear whether they referred to the whole sea or just the eastern part of it.

In Assyrian, there seemed to have been three names for the Sea: *Tâmtu Rab¥tu*('Sea Great', i.e., "Great Sea"), *Tâmtu El¥tu* ('Sea Superior', i.e., "Superior Sea) and *Tâmtu ?a ?ulme ?am?i* ("sea of the setting sun', i.e. "Western Sea"); the first two current during the VI century BC (Parpola 407).

According to the common practice already described above for the ancient Hebrew name, "The [ancient] Greeks seem to have had no general name for the sea: Herodotus merely calls it 'the sea'. Strabo mentions the "sea within the columns", that is, within Calpe and Abyla [the columns of Hercules – Gibraltar]. By their present descendants it is called Aspri Thalassa (the White Sea)" (Smyth 1854:1-2). Modern spoken Greek (demotiki) relies on *Mesojos Thalassa* and formal Greek (katharevousa) uses *Mesochijakos Okjanos* (both "Middle Sea/Ocean).

The Romans, who, according to many writers, were not very fond of sea faring, used attributive appellations: *Mare Nostrum* used by [Pomponius] Mela (Smyth 2), i.e. 44 AD; *Mare Internum* (Bunson 2).

The Sea is a constant presence in Arabic sources and maps from the Xth century on (Pinna 5-7). A variety of names is used, probably according to whether the cartographers were of the Greek-Islamic, Iranian-Islamic or Turkish-Islamic schools. The names include "Sea of Damascus" (Smyth 1854: 342), "Syrian Sea" (*Bahr as-Sam*)—both names are present in the work of the greatest geographer of the XII century, al-Idrisi, "Egyptian Sea" (*Bahr Misr*), "Western Sea" (*al-Bahr al Garbi*), "Byzantian Sea" (*Bahr ar-Rum*). Ibn Khaldum prefers *al-Bahr-alAbyad* ("The White Sea"). In Modern Classical Arabic, the common term is *Al-báhr al-ábyad al-Mutawássit* ('the sea white middle', i.e., "Middle White Sea"); in modern colloquial Arabic the equivalents of both the "White Sea" and the "Middle Sea" are heard.

In Turkish, it is *Ak Deniz* ("White Sea").

In Albanian, the name is *Mesdheu Deti* ("Middle Earth Sea").

The Oxford Companion to Classical Civilization suggests that "the name Mediterranean is not found before Isidorus of Seville" (s.v. Mediterranean). That would put the origin of this particular hydronym around the beginning of the VI century of our era (according to Matvejevic', in *Orig.*, XIII, 16; according to Horden and Purcell 2000:12 in *Etymologies* 12.16.1). By the 1590s the name *Mare Mediterraneum* is a staple of all the maps of the region: it appears thus on Rumold Mercator's map (Tooley et al. 58).

Clearly, all cultures had some special reason to choose the name by which they refer to this body of water. Although linguists are not in agreement as to the grammatical and semantic status of proper names, Rutkowski (28-30) shows that toponyms are created in two ways, the

first being a strategy that seems universal:

"X is such" i.e., direct visible quality (characteristics)

"X is like Y" indirect description (metaphor).

The following table shows the denominations of the Mediterranean Sea in local languages according to chronology and semantics:

time period	**Size**	**possession**	**color**	**location**
	hay-yam hag-gadol'S. Great' Heb.Num. 34:7	"Sea of the Philistines' Heb. Ex.23:31		"Western Sea' Hebrew Deut. 11:24
1250-1150 BCE -	'Great' Egyptian	'Sea of the Philistines' Egyp.		
VI BCE	*Tâmtu Rab_tu* 'Sea Great' Assyrian			*Tâmtu El_tu* 'Sea Superior' *Tâmtu_a_ulme _am_i* 'S. of the setting sun' Assyrian
44 CE		*Mare Nostrum* 'Sea Our' Lat.		*Mare Internum* 'Sea Inside' Lat.
VI cent.				*Mare Mediterraneum* 'Middle Earth' Lat.
X cent.-		'Sea of Damascus' Arab. *Bahr Misr* 'Egyptian S.' Ar. *Al-Bahr al-Garbi* 'Western' Ar. *Bahr ar-Rum* 'Byzantian' Ar.	*Al-Bahr al-Abyd* 'White' Arab.	
2006			*al-Bahr al-Abyad al-Mutawassit* 'Sea White Middle' Cl. Ar.	
			al-Bahr al-Abyad 'White' Coll. Ar.	*al-Bahr al-Mutawassit* 'Middle' Coll. Ar.
			Ak Deniz 'White'' Turk.	*Mesdhe Deti* Middle Earth' Alb.
				yam tikhon 'Middle'Hebr.
				Mesoios Thalassa MesokiakosOkianos 'Middle' Gr. Dem. + Kath.
				Mediterraneo 'Middle Earth' Romance lang.

In all the names listed in the table, it is the semantic motive "X is such" that points to the sea's features – be it color, size, location, or possession. As regards the feature <size>, the motivation is clear: a great expanse of water requires this name. Regarding <possession>, it is sometimes difficult to decide whether the term refers simply to the area around the town/lands mentioned in the name or to the whole sea. Regarding <color>, much has to be said. Lyons suggests that "for whatever reason, though perceptually salient, [color] is not linguistically salient unless and until it is made so by particular languages as a consequence of cultural developments..." (73). The suggestion has been made that in Arabic the sea is white because that is the color of the West to those who come from the East (Matvejevic). The motivation for the feature <location> is also clear, although there seem to be questions around the meaning of "middle earth". Some claim that the meaning of this phrase indicates the extent or the strip of earth between the mountains and the water, rather than the water in-between- earth. Location is not only the preferred semantic feature used in translation of the name; the calques meaning "middle earth" or simply "middle" point to the meaning <sea in the middle of the earth> rather any other reading (for ex., *Stredozemné More* -Slovak; *Mitellandische See/Mittelmeer* - German; *Vali Meri* - Finnish).

The 14 different toponyms for the same place point to at least five considerations about the name of the Mediterranean:

Language and cognition

This variety of names of the Mediterranean is a window to the workings of the human mind: each culture has given or has accorded a special status to some feature of the place that underlies its naming. Although the naming process is universal, the instance of naming is not: there is a limit to which feature was selected in order to name the sea. For the Mediterranean, there seem to exist four such features, namely, size, possession, color, location.

Synonyms in toponymy

Despite the variety of names for the Mediterranean Sea, this situation is not exceptional in toponymy: for example, the capital of Slovakia is *Bratislava* (in Slovak), *Pressburg* (in German), *Poïon* (in Hungarian); the biggest volcano in Europe is *Etna* (in Italian and in other languages), *Mungibeddu* (in Sicilian); many other examples can be adduced to confirm this practice. The number of languages, their socioeconomic and cultural relationship to each other, borrowing processes, sociolinguistic and linguistic considerations, all play a role in keeping the variety of names alive. De Felice mentions that the coexistence of more than one

name for the same place is motivated or maintained on account of the presence of multilingual communities, local vs. official usage, speaker's perspective, from the sea vs. from the land (166).

Official naming practices

This common situation of a variety of place names indicating the same location has led to a number of formal UN meetings to decide on the actual official rendering of geographical names (HorÀanskyã 249-252). Two competing perspectives are at work: on the one hand, local cultural and linguistic usage must be preserved; on the other, a clear unambiguous toponym is desirable from an international standpoint (Kerfoot 202). As Wade put it, "International trends for all language communities are moving toward the use of local names for places or their accepted transliteration" (Wade 11); but the international community needs one unambiguous name. As regards the Mediterranean Sea, no official pronouncements have been made so far. And yet, the Getty Thesaurus of Geographical Names, a web site dedicated to toponymy, indicates as the default "preferred" name its English version (www.getty.edu/vow/_GNFullDisplay). Even though the document that lists the prospects for "The Euro-Mediterranean Partnership" accords a short paragraph to "Preserving and Using Cultural Heritage", nothing is said about toponyms (http://europa.eu.int/comm/external_relations/euromed).

The hegemony of the English name

Although only Malta (among the languages spoken around the Mediterranean) has English as one of its official languages, the English name predominates in much of the global cultural discourse. The adjective Mediterranean is used for a variety of concepts whose meaning encompasses diverse cultural practices, such as gastronomy (Mediterranean diet), restaurant names; literary genres (*polar mediterranée, giallo mediterraneo*); the ubiquitous *Club Med*; EU official policies (cf. the "Barcelona Process"on EuroMed agreements); titles of films (*Méditerranée* 2001, Gabriele Salvatore's *Mediterraneo* 1991), etc. It is customary even in English academic texts regarding ancient history of the Mediterranean area to use maps with the sea designated as Mediterranean – one exception is Arnaiz-Villena et al. (890).

The meaning of <Mediterranean>

In English, "the expression the Mediterranean Sea originates at a learned, somewhat abstract level" (Holden and Purcell 10). The contention is that during and after the Enlightenment (Purcell 16), "when a

term that had applied to the sea was first deployed metonymically to refer to the adjacent lands and then to the collectivity of such lands it coincided with the birth of scientific geography and the deployment of its tools in the service of European geopolitics" (Purcell 13-14 quoting Nordman) and that "the idea of the Mediterranean is...predominantly a European concept" (ibid., 14). By semantic extension, the adjective "Mediterranean" came to mean much more than the Sea.

In the Introductory essay of the first volume of the journal *Mediterranean Language Review*, Henry and Renée Kahane (1983:7-9) suggested two meanings:

i."Mediterranean" means an area which ties a group of countries together and as their common denominator it represents a maritime civilization, with a drift toward leveling. Linguistically, the sea, being both the medium and the content of diffusion..., turns into a creative force.

ii."Mediterranean" means a set of countries around a body of water, each with its language, its long history and its linguistic dilemmas. This is the meaning that linguists give to the term.

The linguistic Mediterranean

It is legitimate to ask the following questions: Was there ever a language common to the Mediterranean area? Are there linguistic Mediterraneisms? Although "The Mediterranean supplies us with the longest and fullest linguistic documentation existing in the world" (Erdal 183), this documentation refers to numerous ancient and modern languages, not to one single linguistic entity. The Mediterranean area is, however, the birthplace of the notion and of the first modern example of a *lingua franca*: the common trade language among Mediterranean sailors and the language used by Christian slaves and their Arabic—or Turkish—speaking owners. It is based on a simplified Romance grammar, with vocabulary drawn from Italian, Arabic, Turkish and other linguistic varieties; for example, *bisogno mi andar* "I have to go"; *Patron donar bona bastonada mucho mucho* "the boss will give me a really thorough beating" (Stolz 7). Some scholars believe that once Portuguese elements replaced the other existing varieties, this resulted in what are now called pidgin languages (Breton 18). Recent studies point to three stages of this language: the first period, 12th-16th centuries, indicates the origin of *lingua franca* – starting from the cultural and linguistic mixing of the Crusaders with speakers of Semitic and later Turkish languages; the second period, 17th century to 1830, indicates the pirates' hegemony; the third period, when the language came to be known as *sabir*, after the French colonization of Algiers (see Operstein 414). Henry and Renée Kahane, who first wrote about lingua franca, list 878 nautical terms in Turkish that

have Greek or other Western origins (1958). The *lingua franca* of the Mediterranean was, as far as can be ascertained, the only modern language that received the input from the various languages spoken around the Mediterranean Sea. (Wansbrough, though, uses the expression "lingua franca" with a different meaning: that of chancery practice common in the Mediterranean area between 1500BC and 1500 CE.)

In linguistics, the phrase 'Mediterranean languages' has two meanings. The first meaning, common to historical linguists and philologists, especially of Italian extraction, refers to pre-Latin, non-IndoEuropean languages of the Mediterranean area. Thus, in this sense, the list of Mediterranean languages includes Etruscan, Punic, Aramaic, paleo-Sardinian, paleo-Ligurian, Sicanian, Rhetic, Iberian. The Egyptian inscriptions mention the following sea peoples, whose languages can only be guessed at: Shardana, Ekwesh, Lukka, Shekelesh, Teresh, Denyen, Weshesh, Peleset, Tjeker (Sandars 114, 132, 161). These pre-Latin, non-Indo-European langauges, it has been claimed, had had an effect of substrate on the latecomers to the Mediterranean area (Tagliavini 119). Some of the linguistic features in use down to the present day reputed to be remnants of the Mediterranean substrate are the following (see also Lausberg 91), especially as regards the Romance languages:

—the retroflex pronunciation in Sicilian and other Romance varieties of the equivalent of the Latin –LL-, for example, Sic. *cavaddu; cuteddu*; etc. (Gensini 35). This feature is present in a vast geographical area from the Indian Ocean to the Mediterranean Sea (Silvestri 211);

—the so-called "gorgia toscana": the aspirated pronunciation of the intervocalic /k/: la hasa – but this has been set straight by Izzo who showed the relatively recent appearance of this feature in Tuscan;

—Some lexemes in Spanish are thought to originate in indigenous Iberian: *cama* "bed", *manteca* "lard" (Green 188; also Spaulding 5-9);

—"most non-Romance elements in Sardinian were either transmitted via other Romance languages or can be attributed to substratal influence" (Jones 1988: 315); there are also similarities with Berber – remnants of possibly an article in *th-* : *thilikerta* "lizard", *thuruku* "neck" (Green, Sardinian, 345).

The second meaning of "Mediterranean languages" is due to modern developments in areal linguistics, and the expression refers to all the languages spoken today (or today and in the past) around the Mediterranean Sea. In 1996 the Italian National Research Council started a research program to study "the Mediterranean <system>: historical and cultural roots, national identities": part of this program was dedicated to linguistic aspects: thus the MEDTYP project was born (Ramat 2002: ix). A number of questions were raised that indicated the same concerns as those of historians, two of which are relevant to our

topic: 1. is it possible to extend the notion of the Mediterranean as a cultural and historical area to linguistic facts? (Ramat 2002:xiii); 2. do coincidences and similarities we find among Mediterranean languages have to be ascribed to language contact or to general (universal?) tendencies which may develop independently in different languages? (Ramat ix). For example, the definite article is used in almost all the languages spoken around the Mediterranean: is the existence of this grammatical feature due to a universal tendency of languages to indicate definiteness in this manner, or did the article develop independently in each language, or still, was the article borrowed into a language that did not have it from another language because of a close contact by the speakers of the two? It turns out that the last two hypotheses seem correct (Ramat 2002:ix). Areal linguistics is the study of one geographical area from a linguistic perspective. Normally, areal studies select a grammatical or lexical feature or characteristics and study its areal dimension. The results are generally plotted on linguistic maps (or given other visual representation), where the lines (isoglosses) separate the territories where the element or structure are used from those that do not use it and thus delimit the area where a feature is present. Researchers have studied numerous linguistic elements in an attempt to tease out those that are common to the languages of the Mediterranean area. (The number of languages and features to be studied is so large, however, that there is a suggestion that an electronic database of linguistic features be used in research on Mediterranean languages [Sansó]).

Three examples of this type of research will suffice to give an indication of the scope and kind of results obtained:

—Da Milano studied yes/no questions in a number of Mediterranean languages. Her conclusion points to heterogeneous results without the possibility to establish a common *Sprachbund*;

—Grandi focused his attention on augmentative suffixes. According to him, there is no *Sprachbund*, but linguistic sub-areas can clearly be established. In his opinion, these sub-areas are due to ancient Greek and Latin influence;

—Stolz analyzed word iteration. His conclusion indicates a possibility of a Mediterranean *Sprachbund* with linguistic sub-areas. This common Mediterranean linguistic area is the result, according to Stolz, of a linguistic contact at the level of *parole*.

Therefore, just as there are various names of the Mediterranean that share some semantic features, there are also many languages around the Mediterranean that share some grammatical features. Perhaps this is the area's strength: its diversity is never so great that it does not include some measure of commonality – be it vegetation, character trait, cultural practices or linguistic features. Myres declared that "... short of a planetary convulsion, there will always be a Mediterranean, with

characteristic mode of life and outlook" (52), and, we can add, languages.

York University

Works Cited

Aitken, John. "On the Color of the Mediterranean and other waters". Edinburgh: *Proceedings of the Royal Society of Edinburgh* (session 1881-1882), 1882.

Arnaiz-Villena, A., Nagah Elaiwa, Carlos Silvera, Ahmed Rostom, Juan Moscoso,Eduardo Gómez-Casado, Luis Allende, Pilar Varela, Jorge Martínez-Laso. "The Origin of Palestinians and Their Genetic Relatedness With Other Mediterranean Populations." *Human Immunology* 62 (1999): 889-900.

Banfi, E. "Introduction." *Percorsi socio- e storico-linguistici nel Mediterraneo,* edited by E. Banfi. Trento: Dipartimento di Scienze Filologiche e Storiche, 1999. 7-18.

Braudel, Fernand. *Memory and the Mediterranean*. New York: Knopf, 2001.

Breton, Roland J.L. *Geolinguistics*. Ottawa: Ottawa University Press, 1991.

Bunson, Matthew. *Encyclopaedia of The Roman Empire*. New York: Facts on File, 2002.

Burr, Vikton. *Ursprung und Gesichte der Namen des Mittelmeeres und seiner Teilmeere im Altertum*. Stuttgart: W. Kohlhammer, 1932.

Da Milano, Federica. "Le domande sì/no nelle lingue del Mediterraneo". *Archivio Glottologico Italiano* 89 1 (2004): 3-40.

De Felice Emidio. "Onomastica." *Linguistica storica*. Edited by Romano Lazzeroni. Firenze: La Nuova Italia Scientifica, 1989. 147-179.

Dorion, H. "A qui appartient le nom de lieu?" *ONOMA* 32 (1994 – 95): 95-103.

Erdal, M. "Review of *Mediterranean Languages*." P. Ramat and T. Stolz (eds.). *Mediterranean Language Review* 14 (2002): 170-184.

Fiume, Giovanna (ed.). "Introduzione." *Onore e storia nelle società mediterranee*. Palermo: La Luna, 1989. 5-22.

Gardner, Anne E. "The Great Sea of Dan." *Vetus Testamentum* XLIX, 3 (1999): 412- 414.

Gensini, Stefano. *Elementi di storia linguistica italiana*. Milano: Minerva Italica, 1985.

Getty Thesaurus of Geographical Names. www.getty.edu/vow/_GNFullDisplay

Grandi, Nicola. "Development and spread of augmentative suffixes in the Mediterranean." *Mediterranean Languages*, edited by Paolo Ramat and Thomas Stolz. Bochum: Universitätsverlag, Dr. N. Brockmeyer, 2002. 171-190.

Green, John N. "Spanish." *The Romance Languages*, edited by Martin Harris and Nigel Vincent. Kent: Croom Helm, 1988. 79-130.

Holmen, Diego. *Atlas de Diego Holmen* 1561. Madrid: Patronato del mar. Fundacion General Mediterranea, 1975.

Horden, Peregrine and Nicholas Purcell. *The Corrupting Sea. A Study of Mediterranean History*. Oxford: Blackwell, 2000.

HorÀanskyã, Imrich. "Medzinárodná regulácia standardizácie a pouÏivania vÏi-

tychnázvov-exonym." *Vlastne mená v jazyku a spoloãnosti.* Bratislava: Jazykovedny'Ustav L. ·túra, 2000. 247-258.

Hornblower, S. and A. Spawforth. The *Oxford Companion to Classical Civilization.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998.

Izzo, Herbert J. *Tuscan and Etruscan.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1972.

Jones, M. "Sardinian." The Romance Languages. Edited by Martin Harris and Nigel Vincent. Kent: Croom Helm, 1991. 14-350

Kahane, Henry and Renée. "Introductory Essay: Aspects of Mediterranean Linguistics." *Mediterranean Language Review* 1 (1983): 7-9.

Kahane, Henry and Renée, Andreas Tietze. *The Lingua Franca.* Urbana: University of Illinois, 1958.

Kerfoot, H. "Wien or Vienna; Kalaallit or Nunaat, Grønland or Greenland?" *ONOMA* 35 (2000): 199-213.

King, R. "Introduction: An Essay on Mediterraneism." R. King, L. Proudfoot, B. Smith (eds.). *The Mediterranean. Environment and Society.* London: Arnold, 1997. 1-11.

Lausberg, Heinrich. *Lingüística románica.* Madrid: Gredos, 1976.

Lyons, John. "The vocabulary of color with particular reference to ancient Greek and Classical Latin." *The Language of Color in the Mediterranean.* Edited by Alexander Borg. Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell International, 1999. 38-75.

Matvejeviç, Predrag. "Quel ponte tra due mari." *Il Mattino* 17 Oct. 2001.

Myers, John L. *Mediterranean Culture.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1944.

Operstein, N. "Review of *A língua franca mediterrânea: histórico, textos e interpretação*" by Hildo Honório do Couto. *Journal of Pidgin and Creole Languages* 19, 2 (2004): 410-414.

Parpola, S. *Neo-Assyrian Toponyms.* Neukirchen-Vluyn: Butzon & Becker, 1970.

Purcell, Nicholas. "The Boundless Sea of Unlikeness? On Defining the Mediterranean." *Mediterranean Historical Review* 18, 2 (2003): 9-29.

Pinna, Margherita. *Il Mediterraneo e la Sardegna nella cartografia Musulmana.* Nuoro: Istituto Superiore Regionale Etnografico, 1996.

Portugali, Juval. The Mediterranean Cognitive Map, *Mediterranean Historical Review* 19, 2 (2004):16-24.

Ramat, Paolo. "Introduction." *Mediterranean Languages. Papers from the MED-TYP Workshop.* Edited. by P. Ramat and Thomas Stolz . Bochum: Universitäts Verlag, 2002. ix-xv.

Rose, J.H. 1934. *The Mediterranean in the Ancient World.* New York: Glenwood Press, 1934.

Rutkowski, M. "Two Types of Descriptiveness in Names." *Onomastica Canadiana* 83 (2001): 25-38.

Sandars, N.K.. 1985. *The Sea Peoples. Warriors of the ancient Mediterranean 1250-1150 B.C.* London: Thames and Hudson, 1985.

Sansó, Andrea. "MED-TYP: A Typological Database for Mediterranean Languages."http://www.unipv.it/wwwling/LREC_sanso.pdf

Silvestri, Domenico. "Aree tipologiche preistoriche." *Dalla linguistica areale alla tipologia linguistica,* edited by Ines Loi Corvetto. Roma: Cagliari, 2002. 207-227.

Smyth, W.H. *The Mediterranean. A Memoir physical historical and nautical.* London: John Parker & Son, 1854.

Spaulding, Robert K. *How Spanish Grew*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1971.

Stolz, Thomas. 2003/04. "A New Mediterraneism: Word Iteration in an Areal Perspective." *Mediterranean Language Review* 15 (2003 – 04): 1-47.

Tagliavini, Carlo. *Le origini delle lingue neolatine*. Bologna: Patron, 1969.

Tooley, R.V., C. Bricker, G. Rose Crone. *Landmarks of Mapmaking*. Amsterdam: Elsevier, 1968.

Wade, Daniel G. "Exonyms as geographical names: The Example of Portuguese."*Onomastica Canadiana* 72, 1 (1990): 11-26.

Wansborough, J.E. *Lingua franca in the Mediterranean*. Surrey: Curzon Press, 1996.

Reviews

Irrigation and Society in Islamic Granada.

Trillo San José, Carmen. *Agua, tierra y hombres en al-Andalus. La dimensión agrícola del mundo nazarí.* Granada: Ajbar, 2004. ISBN: 84-609-0718-X. 307pp + 11 maps and figures + 12 colour photographs.

Idem. *Una sociedad rural en el Mediterráneo medieval: el mundo agrícola nazarí.* Granada: Libro de Bolsillo, 2003. ISBN: 84-607-8623-3. 221pp + 11 maps and figures.

The Nasrid Kingdom of Granada (1238–1492), although famous for its most grandiose monument, the Alhambra palace, has traditionally been relegated to the sidelines of history. Regarded neither as pertaining to the historical Europe nor to the Islamic world proper, historical hindsight in view of the conquest of 1492 has made of it little more than a postscript to the grand history of Golden Age Muslim Iberia. This is an historiographical injustice that Carmen Trillo endeavours to right in her investigation of the rural society and economy of late Medieval Granada. This is no easy task: there are relatively few sources for the political history of the kingdom, but for agricultural history the panorama is even more bleak. As Trillo explains, a number of factors including the nature of Islamic law and custom, the effects of the conquest and the tendency for land to be exchanged among family members has meant that few archival records from the Muslim period were maintained and almost none have survived. Thus, these two works draw heavily on Castilian documentation originating in the wake of the conquest, which was carried out in spurts from the mid–thirteenth to the late-fifteenth century. Most notable among these sources are the *libros de repartimento*, the surveys drawn up by the Christians in order to distribute the conquered lands among the victors. Trillo acknowledges the dangers of using Castilian documentation to shed light on the pre-conquest era, but argues convincingly that valuable and valid insights can be gained from it. Because of the spotty nature of the surviving material Trillo focuses on a handful of specific locales mostly in the environs of the capital, for example the area of El Quempe, Cenete, and the irrigation system of Aynadamar, which serve as case studies illustrating the broader themes addressed in the work.

Trillo argues that the arrival of the Muslims in the early eighth century precipitated a veritable agricultural revolution in Iberia, one in which the large-scale dry cereal farming and viticulture which had been the hallmark of the Roman period declined in importance. The transformation was produced thanks to the "green revolution" (as Andrew M. Watson has described it) which resulted from the introduction of plants and products from across the Islamic world. High-value market-garden crops demanded the development of the same sorts of complex irrigation systems which had developed in North Africa and the Middle East. These systems, however, could only emerge as a result of the colonization which followed the Muslim conquest in the areas where Arabs and Berbers settled. The agricultural and hydraulic profile of the new settle-

ments reflected the agnatic endogamous extended family structures typical of the Islamic world (as Guichard, Glick, Barceló and Acien have described). Thus, by the tenth century the Andalusi countryside, as a result of this "revolution" came to be comprised of small villages each related to a single clan, directed by a council of elders, and only loosely supervised by the caliphal state. Here a relatively homogenous community of small proprietors worked intensively irrigated market gardens raising diversified crops aimed not at supplying a commercial or industrial market but rather at guaranteeing self-sufficiency for the small-holder through diversification. In addition to the land that was held by individuals (*mamluka*), lands held in common, by the community or of unascribed ownership (*harim*, and *mawat*), provided each village with grazing land, fields for dry crops, and a margin for expansion.

This reflects the characterization of Andalusi society accepted by most scholars. The larger question which Trillo endeavours to answer is: was there a subsequent revolution in the Nasrid kingdom that by the fifteenth century, had led to the decline of the agnatic and endogamous system that, according to Guichard and others was essential to Andalusi society? (*Una sociedad rural*, p. 24) This is an important question as it relates directly to the nature of the impact that Castilian domination would have on the socio-economic panorama of southern Spain. By the sixteenth-century large-scale mercantile plantation operations had emerged, geared, for example, to supplying sugar to an export market. These might possibly be linked to the sprawling aristocratic estates, Muslim *latifundia*, which are commonly believed to have been a defining feature of the countryside south of the Gaudalquivir. Trillo argues that there was indeed a social revolution in Nasrid Granada, but that the role and importance of the aristocratic estates was exaggerated by contemporary chroniclers and geographers and hence has been misunderstood by modern historians. Here detailed reconstruction of irrigation and fields systems and, where possible, the patchwork of field ownership, shows that with the exception of royal estates, these country manors were much more modest than has been previously assumed. Moreover, even on larger estates, the fields themselves were typically worked by *shirka*, share-cropping, in which the tenants managed the land using the same strategies and approaches as the small free-holders.

The revolution it seems consisted in the gradual weakening of the clan system. Despite the various strategies that were employed to ensure that landed patrimony remained within the ambit of the broader patrilineal extended family (including mainemorte, pious donations, gifts *inter vivos*, etc.) tendencies such as the right for women to inherit property under Islamic law, contributed to its gradual dispersal. Once the lands held by a given clan were no longer contiguous, and could not be managed or controlled as a whole, individual land ownership became more important. The sale and purchase of land became more common as the stigma attached to the loss of clan patrimony disappeared. As a consequence, social inequalities became more acute, and new local elites emerged. The members of these local elites, consisting of wealthier farmers who often also occupied religious or administrative positions, became increasingly interested in exogamous marriage as a means of forming alliances with nuclear families of similar social and economic standing rather than strengthening their bonds with poorer members of their own clans.

By the late fifteenth-century the Granadan social revolution was well

underway and the Andalusi countryside presented a diverse panorama of property types and increased concentration of land ownership in the hands of a privileged few. This occurred on a much more modest scale than in the Latin world where the emergence of feudal structures acted as a catalyst for social differentiation and the eventual emergence of a capitalist class that shared no affinity with the productive classes. In principle the realignment of Nasrid society reflected the same shift towards exogamy that Goody describes Latin society undergoing after the eleventh-century, but with the difference that here this process was not deliberately sponsored by a religious institution. Whereas in the West the Church imposed the exogamous model, in al-Andalus the ideal of the agnatic endogamous society continued to exercise a profound influence as a social model whether it was actually practised or not. In the end, the process of transformation in Granada was dramatically truncated by the Christian conquest, which imposed a new model of administration, social organization and economic exploitation. For Trillo, the proto-capitalism of the sixteenth-century plantations could not have emerged out of the Kingdom of Granada which was, drawing on the language of Samir Amin, a tributary society, fundamentally different from that which was emerging in the West.

Of the two works under consideration here, both cover essentially the same basic subject although they differ in format and emphasis. *Una sociedad rural* serves more as an introduction to the topic, while *Agua, tierra y hombres en al-Andalus* will be of more interest to scholars and to North American readers, given that it is more complete, more scholarly in format and presentation and that it presents a broader and more coherent approach to the topic at hand. Trillo not only draws on a whole range of theoretical approaches (archaeology, sociology, economics) effectively but draws convinncing and thought-provoking comparisons to similar or contrasting situations in contemporary England, France and the Low Countries, and Byzantium, not to mention the contemporary and modern Maghrib, Egypt and Palestine. As such her work not only addresses a notable historical *lacuna* but does so with a degree of sophistication and a scope that local studies typically lack. This work will be of interest not only to experts in Islamic Spain, but to students and scholars of the economy and rural society of Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe, the Mediterranean and the Islamic World.

BRIAN A. CATLOS
University of California Santa Cruz

MEMBER OF SCABRINI GROUP

Québec, Canada
2006


9 770022 684182